

Community Study about Lighting Hanukkah Candles (Grade 5)

T. Bavli, Masechet Shabbat 21b, lines 18 - 39

STANDARD #1: Textual Access

Students will develop the skills to read, navigate and comprehend a variety of genres of rabbinic literature, fostering the ability to understand rabbinic texts independently.

BENCHMARKS:

- TA 20c Identifies names of key rabbinic figures and places them in the correct Rabbinic period.
- TA 22a Applies key rabbinic concepts to a familiar Jewish practice.

STANDARD #2: Jewish Identity and Practice

Students will develop a rich and nuanced understanding of themselves as Jews and shape their commitments to Jewish practice through a deep engagement with rabbinic teachings and texts.

BENCHMARKS:

- JIP 10b Describes a selected ritual or practice found in rabbinic texts, employing rabbinic terms and phrases to describe component parts.
- JIP 25b Recognizes that different practices reflect multiple legitimate ways to practice Judaism.

UNWRAPPING

STANDARD: TEXTUAL ACCESS Students will develop the skills to read, navigate and comprehend a variety of genres of rabbinic literature, fostering the ability to understand rabbinic texts independently.

BENCHMARK: TA.20c Identifies names of key rabbinic figures and places them in the correct Rabbinic period.

Students will know	Students will be able to do	Content Material
<p>Rabbinic figures</p> <p>Rabbinic periods</p>	<p>Recognize rabbinic names</p> <p>Identify rabbinic period in which rabbis lived (tannaitic and amoraic)</p> <p>Explain key details about individual figures</p> <p>Make connections between rabbinic figure</p>	<p>Content (T=Tanna, A=Amora)</p> <p>T -Bet Hillel (school of thought)</p> <p>T - Bet Shammai (school of thought)</p> <p>T - Rabbanan, as in <i>tanu rabbanan</i></p> <p>Z'keinim</p> <p>A - Amoraim</p> <p>A - Ulla (traveller between Bavel and Eretz Yisrael)</p> <p>A - Rava (head of a babylonian <i>yeshiva</i>).</p> <p>Bet Hillel and Bet Shammai are two contemporaneous schools of thought.</p> <p>Ulla connects the Babylonian amoraim to the Eretz Yisrael amoraim (and vice versa).</p> <p>Questions:</p> <p>What's the relationship between [Bet] Hillel and [Bet] Shammai?</p> <p>What's the difference between Hillel and Bet Hillel?</p> <p>Learning Activities:</p> <p>Graphic organizer - timeline of rabbinic periods</p>

STANDARD: TEXTUAL ACCESS Students will develop the skills to read, navigate and comprehend a variety of genres of rabbinic literature, fostering the ability to understand rabbinic texts independently.

BENCHMARK: TA 22a Applies key rabbinic concepts to a familiar Jewish practice.

Students will know	Students will be able to do	Content Material
Rabbinic concepts	Identify concept in the text Explain concept in the text Make connections between concept in the text and personal practice	Content: <i>hiddur mitzvah</i> <i>ma'alin b'kodesh v'ein moridim</i> <i>parei hachag</i> (using precedent) <i>pirsuma d'nissa</i> <i>sha'at sacanah</i> <i>ner shel mitzvah/ner acheret</i> <i>adam chashuv</i> Questions: How is Hanukkah connected to Sukkot?
Jewish practice	Describe practice found in a rabbinic text	Content: Hanukkah candle lighting: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● number of candles ● number of <i>channukiyot</i> per house ● directionality lighting candles ● placement of <i>chanukkiyah</i> Sacrifices on Sukkot
Connection between concept and practice	Explain the connection between a rabbinic concept and a rabbinic practice	Content: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● <i>Hiddur mitzvah</i> is practiced on Hanukkah by adding candles/<i>hanukkiyot</i> to the ritual in each household. ● The practice of adding a candle each night is an application of the concept of <i>ma'alin b'kodesh</i>. ● Bet Shammai's practice of reducing a candle each night is based upon (according to one opinion) the pattern of the sacrificing of bulls on Sukkot. ● Placing the <i>hanukkiyah</i> in a window is application of the concept of <i>pirsuma d'nissa</i>. ● We change our practice during when there is danger for the sake of safety.

STANDARD: JEWISH IDENTITY AND PRACTICE Students will develop a rich and nuanced understanding of themselves as Jews and shape their commitments to Jewish practice through a deep engagement with rabbinic teachings and texts.

BENCHMARK: JIP 10b Describes a selected ritual or practice found in rabbinic texts, employing rabbinic terms and phrases to describe component parts.

Students will know	Students will be able to do	Content Material
Judaism has rituals and practices.	Recognize the correct name of a Jewish ritual and practice	Content: "Mitzvat Hanukkah"
<i>Rituals and practices are performed at specific times.</i>	<i>Connect a ritual or practice with its appropriate time</i>	Content: <i>Not present in selected text.</i>
There are appropriate ways to refer to rituals.	Connect the appropriate terminology to a specific ritual or practice	Content: "Ner Hanukkah" "Hadlakat ner Hanukkah"
Rabbinic texts present specific ways to perform a ritual or practice.	Explain how to perform a ritual or practice based upon a rabbinic text	Content: One candle per household each night (options for <i>hiddur mitzvah</i> include, one candle per person and adding candles each night [Bet Hillel] or starting with eight candles the first night and decreasing each night [Bet Shammai]). Candles are displayed outside, by one's doorway. If one lives on an upper floor, one can display the candles by a window that faced the public thoroughfare. This rule is suspended in times of danger. One is required to have another source of light in the household, either an additional candle or a hearth-fire. An "important" person (who is used to using a lamp and not a hearth-fire), must have an additional candle.

STANDARD: JEWISH IDENTITY AND PRACTICE Students will develop a rich and nuanced understanding of themselves as Jews and shape their commitments to Jewish practice through a deep engagement with rabbinic teachings and texts.

BENCHMARK: JIP 25b Recognizes that different practices reflect multiple legitimate ways to practice Judaism.

Students will know	Students will be able to do	Content Material
There are different ways that people perform a specific ritual or practice	<p>Explains the multiple approaches to a particular practice as described in the text</p> <p>Describe a plurality of legitimate ways to perform a specific ritual or practice</p> <p><i>Participate in a legitimate ritual or practice that is performed differently from one's personal practice</i></p>	<p>Content: <i>Mitzvat Hanukkah v. Mehadrin v. Mehadrin min haMehadrin</i></p> <p>Bet Hillel v. Bet Shammai</p> <p>Normal times v. <i>sha'at sacanah</i></p> <p>Ground floor v. upper floor</p> <p>"Regular" person v. "Important person"</p>
There can be multiple legitimate ways to perform a specific ritual or practice,	Demonstrates respect for people who perform a ritual or practice in a different way than they do	<p>Content: The text presents multiple practices, recognizes both, and provides evidence that both were utilized [e.g. Bet Hillel and Bet Shammai].</p> <p>Question: How does one manage the tension between the notion that there is a proper way to perform a ritual or practice and the notion that there can be multiple legitimate ways to do so?</p>
Rabbinic texts, at times, present multiple legitimate practices.	<p>Identify when multiple legitimate practices are present in a rabbinic text</p> <p>Explain how/why multiple legitimate practices arose</p>	<p>Content: See row #1, above.</p> <p>Plurality of practice can be based upon context [e.g. the floor on which one lives, the safety of one's context].</p> <p>Plurality of practice can be based upon school of thought [e.g. Bet Hillel v. Bet Shammai].</p> <p>Question: How does one determine when diversity of practice is legitimate?</p>

BIG IDEAS AND ESSENTIAL QUESTIONS

BIG IDEAS:

- **Ritual and practice serve as entry points into Judaism/the Jewish Community.**
- **Using the right language can help make me an insider.**
- **The Rabbis helped shape our practice.**
- **There is a right way to do things.**
- **People do things differently.**

ESSENTIAL QUESTIONS:

- **How can we be doing things right if we do things differently?**
- **Where does my practice come from?**
- **Does it matter how I choose to practice?**
- **How does language help me to be a part of the community?**

ENGAGING SCENARIO AND PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT

ENGAGING SCENARIO:

The Jewish Federations of North America have commissioned a study of how Americans perform the ritual of lighting Hannukkah candles and from where family traditions are derived. As a leading sociologist in the Jewish community, you have been hired to do the study. Your job is to search the rabbinic text to derive the questions that will guide the survey and to survey selected families from your community and report your findings to the Federation.

PERFORMANCE ASSESSMENT:

TASK 1: CREATE THE SURVEY

Use the talmudic text from Shabbat 21b to create the questions for the survey - what are the questions that emerge from each section of the text?

TEXT	Identify Options for Practice	Rabbinic Figure/Period	Rationale/Reasons	Question for Survey
Ner ish u' beito/mehadrin				
Mehadrin/mehadrin min ha'mehadrin				
Beit Hillel/Beit Shammai				
Ner hanukkah mitzvah l'hanikha...				
Ner acheret/medura				

(Class creates a uniform survey based on the recommendations of each individual student)

TASK 2: INTERVIEWS

Interview a member of your household and of two other households (family or friends). Record their responses to each of the questions in the survey and bring the data to class.

TASK 3: DATA ANALYSIS

Code your data. Review the survey responses. Identify and label practices found in the talmudic texts we studied. Identify and label practices that do not appear in the text we studied.

(Class creates bar graph of data)

TASK 4: ECHOES OF THE PAST

Write the report. Include the bar graph that we generated, a narrative explanation of the data, and a presentation of the rationales that individuals that you interviewed provided to explain the origins of their practice and the rationale that they used to select it. Be sure to note the names of rabbis associated with the teaching of the particular practice/s, and to point out any current practices that are not in line with rabbinic teachings.

Include the following items in your report:

- What echoes from the rabbis do you see in the answers from today?
- What reasons for practice from the talmud were reflected in the survey results?
- What reasons for practice did people report that we don't hear in the rabbinic record?
- (Conclusion) Reflect on the idea that there is a proper way to perform a ritual or practice, and the idea that there can be multiple legitimate ways to do so.

Unit to Lessons Grid
(Moving from the standards-based unit design to planning the lessons in the unit)
Shabbat 21b Hanukkah Unit Plan

Lesson #	Lesson Summary	Text	Connection to Unwrapping	Connection to Big Ideas/ Essential Questions	Connection to Performance Assessment Task(s)
1	Set induction: Expose diversity of practice regarding the lighting of Hanukkah candles within the class. Introduction of engaging scenario.	N/A	JIP 25b: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> There are different ways that people perform a specific ritual or practice Describe a plurality of legitimate ways to perform a specific ritual or practice 	BI -People do things differently. EQ -How can we be doing things right if we do things differently?	Engaging Scenario
2	Different Practices: Candle Lighting	Lines 18-23 (Beraita #1)	JIP 10b <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Connect the appropriate terminology to a specific ritual or practice (<i>mitzvat Hanukkah, ner Hanukkah</i>) Explain how to perform a ritual or practice based on a rabbinic text (Bet Hillel, Bet Shammai, <i>mehadrin, mehadrin min hamehadrin</i>) TA 20c <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Recognizes rabbinic names (Bet Hillel, Bet Shammai) TA 22a <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Describe practice found in a rabbinic text (options for lighting candles) Explain concept in text (<i>hiddur mitzvah</i>) 	BI - The Rabbis helped shape our practice. BI - Ritual and practice serve as entry points into Judaism/the Jewish Community.	Task 1

3	Diversity of Practice: Precedent for following both Hillel and Shammai	Lines 23-28 (Amar Ulla) Lines 28-32 (Amar Rabbah bar Hanna)	<p>TA 20c</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Explain key details about individual rabbinic figures (Ulla - Traveler between Bavel and Eretz Yisrael) <p>TA 22a</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Explain concept in the text (<i>parei hechag, ma'alin bakodesh...</i>) <p>JIP 10b</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Explain how to perform a ritual or practice based upon a rabbinic text (positions of Bet Hillel and Bet Shammai) <p>JIP 25b</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● There are different ways that people perform a specific ritual or practice ● Explains the multiple approaches to a particular practice as described in the text ● Explain how/why multiple legitimate practices arose 	<p>BI - People do things differently.</p> <p>EQ - Does it matter how I choose to practice?</p> <p>EQ - How can we be doing things right if we do things differently?</p>	Task 1
4	Different Practices: Placement of the <i>chanukkiyah</i>	Lines 32-36 (Beraita #2)	<p>TA 22a</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Explain concept in the text (<i>sha'at sakkannah</i>) ● Explain the connection between a rabbinic concept and a rabbinic practice (<i>sha'at sakkannah</i> and <i>chanukkiyah</i> placement) <p>JIP 10b</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Rabbinic texts present specific ways to perform a ritual or practice (placement of <i>chanukkiyah</i>) ● Explain how to perform a ritual or practice based upon a rabbinic text (placement of <i>chanukkiyah</i>) 	BI - The Rabbis helped shape our practice.	Task 1
5	Different Practices: <i>Ner acheret</i> or <i>medurah</i>	Lines 36-39 (Amar Rava)	<p>TA 20c</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Recognize rabbinic names (Rava) ● Explain key details about individual figures (head of Babylonian <i>yeshiva</i>) <p>TA 22a</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Describe practice found in rabbinic text (<i>ner acheret</i>) ● Describe concept in the text (<i>adam chashuv</i>) ● Make connections between concept in the text and personal practice (<i>ner acheret</i> for light in students' homes) <p>JIP 10b</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Connect the appropriate terminology to a specific ritual or practice (different types of light - <i>medura, or</i>) ● Explain how perform a ritual/practice based upon rabbinic text 	BI - The Rabbis helped shape our practice.	Task 1

6	Students edit explanation of personal practice using language of the rabbis	Lines 18-39	<p>TA 22a</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Identify concept in the text ● Explain concept in the text ● Explain connection between a rabbinic concept and a rabbinic practice ● Make connections between concept in the text and personal practice <p>JIP 10b</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Recognize the correct name of a Jewish ritual and practice ● Connects the appropriate terminology to a specific ritual or practice <p>JIP 25b</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Identifies when multiple legitimate practices are present in a rabbinic text ● Describes a plurality of legitimate ways to perform a specific ritual or practice 	<p>BI - Ritual and practice serve as entry points into Judaism/the Jewish Community.</p> <p>BI - Using the right language can help make me an insider.</p> <p>BI - There is a right way to do things.</p> <p>BI - People do things differently.</p> <p>EQ - How does language help me to be a part of the community?</p> <p>EQ - Where does my practice come from?</p>	Foreshadow task 4.
7	Develop the survey	Lines 18-39	<p>TA 22a</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Describe practice found in a rabbinic text ● Describe a plurality of legitimate ways to perform a specific ritual or practice ● Make connections between concept in the text and personal practice <p>JIP 10b</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Rabbinic texts present specific ways to perform a ritual or practice 	BI - People do things differently.	Task 1
HW	Task 2: Interviews	N/A	<p>JIP 10b</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Connects the appropriate terminology to a specific ritual or practice ● Explain how to perform a ritual or practice based upon a rabbinic text <p>TA 22a</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Make connections between concept in the text and personal practice 	<p>BI - Ritual and practice serve as entry points into Judaism/the Jewish Community.</p> <p>EQ - Where does my practice come from?</p>	Task 2

8	Task 3: Data Analysis	Lines 18-39	<p>TA 22a</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Identify concept in the text ● Make connections between concept in the text and personal practice <p>JIP 10b</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Recognize the correct name of a Jewish ritual and practice ● Connect the appropriate terminology to a specific ritual or practice <p>JIP 25b</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● There are different ways that people perform a specific ritual or practice 	<p>BI - Ritual and practice serve as entry points into Judaism/the Jewish Community.</p> <p>BI - Using the right language can help make me an insider.</p> <p>BI - People do things differently.</p> <p>EQ - How does language help me to be a part of the community?</p> <p>EQ - Where does my practice come from?</p>	Task 3
9	Task 4: Write the Report	Lines 18-39	<p>TA 20c</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Identify rabbinic period in which rabbis lived ● Explain key details about individual figures <p>TA 22a</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Make connections between concept in the text and personal practice ● Explain the connection between a rabbinic concept and a rabbinic practice <p>JIP 10b</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Connect appropriate terminology to a specific ritual or practice ● Rabbinic texts present specific ways to perform a ritual or practice <p>JIP 25b</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Demonstrate respect for people who perform a ritual or practice in a different way than they do ● Explain how/why multiple legitimate practices arose 	All	Task 4