William Davidson Graduate School of Jewish Education

### Legacy Heritage Instructional Leadership Institute



### God and Holiness (Kedushah)

Students will explore rabbinic conceptions of God, holiness (*kedushah*) and religious life. In doing so, they will grapple with eternal theological, existential and spiritual questions, develop their capacity to engage in theological discourse, and explore religious practices through which the rabbis connected to God.

Rabbinic literature presents a wide range of ideas about God, holiness, spirituality and religious life. Rabbinic texts explore the nature of God and holiness (kedushah). They describe the relationship between God and humanity as a whole, and the uniqueness of God's relationship to the Jewish people. They present pathways to living a spiritually rich religious life and tell stories about those who aspire to do so. They raise and attempt to answer existential questions about the purpose of creation, the meaning of life, the nature of God, and the path to fulfilling God's vision for the world and humanity.

Through this standard, students will encounter rabbinic texts that, explicitly and implicitly, discuss these ideas, and will build an understanding of the plurality of perspectives that the rabbis offer. They will come to see the rabbinic endeavor as an invaluable resource for their own grappling with spiritual and existential concerns, both personal and communal.

Reading rabbinic literature through this lens will build students' capacity to open their theological imagination, to encounter, describe, and construct holiness in their world, to engage in conversation about God and that which they understand to be sacred, to cultivate their own relationships with God, to respond to eternal theological, existential and spiritual questions; to build their capacity to sense and experience holiness, and, to develop spiritual practices, rooted in Jewish tradition, that will add meaning to their lives.

DRAFT DOCUMENT NOT FOR DISTRIBUTION

#### God and Holiness (Kedushah)

**Standard:** Students will explore rabbinic conceptions of God, holiness (*kedushah*), and religious life. In doing so, they will grapple with eternal theological, existential and spiritual questions, develop their capacity to engage in theological discourse, and explore religious practices through which the rabbis connected to God.

#### **Preamble:**

Rabbinic literature presents a wide range of ideas about God, holiness, spirituality, and religious life. Rabbinic texts explore the nature of God and holiness (*kedushah*). They describe the relationship between God and humanity as a whole, and the uniqueness of God's relationship to the Jewish people. They present pathways to living a spiritually rich religious life and tell stories about those who aspire to do so. They raise and attempt to answer existential questions about the purpose of creation, the meaning of life, the nature of God, and the path to fulfilling God's vision for the world and humanity.

Through this standard, students will encounter rabbinic texts that, explicitly and implicitly, discuss these ideas, and will build an understanding of the plurality of perspectives that the rabbis offer. They will come to see the rabbinic endeavor as an invaluable resource for their own grappling with spiritual and existential concerns, both personal and communal.

Reading rabbinic literature through this lens will build students' capacity to open their theological imagination, to encounter, describe, and construct holiness in their world, to engage in conversation about God and that which they understand to be sacred, to cultivate their own relationships with God, to respond to eternal theological, existential and spiritual questions; to build their capacity to sense and experience holiness, and, to develop spiritual practices, rooted in Jewish tradition, that will add meaning to their lives.

#### **Organizing Principles:**

- 1. Rabbinic Theology: What do the rabbis believe about God? How do the rabbis articulate their beliefs? What challenges about belief in God do the rabbis raise? What solutions/responses do they propose? How can rabbinic theology support the development of my own theology? How do I respond to rabbinic theological ideas that do not conform to my own beliefs or to my understanding of how God functions in the universe?
  - Through their study of rabbinic texts, students will explore rabbinic theology and challenges to belief in God that the rabbis faced and preserved in rabbinic literature. In addition to deepening their understanding of rabbinic beliefs, students will explore how rabbinic theology can support the development of their own theology and respond to rabbinic theological ideas that do not conform to their own beliefs or understanding of how God functions in the universe.
- 2. **Covenant:** How do the rabbis understand the relationship between God and humanity? God and the Jewish people? Through their study of rabbinic texts, students will explore rabbinic notions of covenant in order to understand how the rabbis envision God's relationship with humanity in general, and with the Jewish people in particular. In doing so, they will begin to formulate how rabbinic conceptions of covenant (might) inform the way they understand their relationship with God.
- 3. Holiness (Kedushah): How do the rabbis describe encounters with kedushah? How do the rabbis create sacred time and sacred space? How do they envision the sacredness found in nature and in people?
  Through their study of rabbinic texts, students will come to understand the plurality of ways that the rabbis encounter, describe, and construct holiness (kedushah). Their learning may include notions of sacredness in nature, in time, in space, and in others.
- 4. Religious Practices that Connect us to God: What religious practices connect us to God? How do we balance our need to nurture our spiritual selves with other needs and responsibilities? How do the rabbis envision a life of study (talmud torah), worship (avodah) and action (gemilut hasadim and mitzvot)? How can I incorporate these practices into my life? Through their study of rabbinic texts, students will explore Jewish religious practices that the rabbis considered to be essential parts of a Jew's life and those that help connect us to God.

#### **Benchmarks**

Organizing Principle #1a: Rabbinic Theology: Beliefs about God
What do the rabbis believe about God?
How do the rabbis articulate their beliefs?

Theme	K-2 Pre-Text	3-5 Beginning	6-8 Intermediate	9-12 Advanced
Images/Names for God	GHK.10a Discusses names of God used in rabbinic texts.	GHK.10b Explains names/images of God found in rabbinic texts.	GHK.10c Describes what is appealing and challenging about a name/image of God found in a particular rabbinic text.	GHK.10d Explains the theological beliefs that lie behind a particular name/image of God found in rabbinic texts.
Images/Names for God (cont.)	GHK.10e Describes metaphors for God.	GHK.10f Compares different names/images of God in a particular rabbinic text.	GHK.10g Makes connections between metaphors of God in various rabbinic texts.	GHK.10h Contrasts conflicting images of God found in disparate rabbinic texts.
Images/Names for God (cont.)	GHK.10i Completes the sentence: God is like an X because  Note: a known rabbinic metaphor is substituted for X	GHK.10j Identifies metaphors for God in a rabbinic text.	GHK.10k Explains how metaphors about God are used to convey a particular belief about God.	GHK.10I Explains the theological difference between a literal and metaphoric reading of a text.

Characteristics of God	GHK.11a Lists characteristics of God found in rabbinic texts.	GHK.11b Explains characteristics of God found in rabbinic texts.	GHK.11c Lists multiple characteristics of God depicted in a single image of God citing textual evidence for support.	GHK.11c Provides textual evidence to support "Big Theological Ideas" about God.  Examples: God forgives those who are repentant
Characteristics of God(cont.)	GHK.11e Describes God's character or role in a particular text or narrative.	GHK.11f Compares God's character or role in a particular rabbinic text to alternate images of God.	GHK.11g Draws a connection between the character of God as portrayed in a particular text and portrayals of God in a previously seen text.	GHK.11h Infers what the rabbis find compelling and troubling about a particular portrayal of God in a rabbinic text citing textual support.
The Depiction of God Across the Variety of Rabbinic Texts	GHK.12a Explores images of God that emerge from tefillah and brachot.	GHK.12b Explores images of God that emerge from tefillah, brachot, and rabbinic aggadah.	GHK.12c Compares images of God across a variety of genres of rabbinic literature.  Examples: poetry, prose, midrash, aggadah, mishnah	GHK.12d Constructs a layered depiction of God using talmudic and post-talmudic writings.  Examples: gemara, rishonim, philosophical treatises, parshanut
Comparing and Contrasting Rabbinic Theologies	GHK.13a Explores stories with conflicting views of God.	GHK.13b Identifies conflicting views of God found in rabbinic texts.	GHK.13c Distinguishes between different conceptions of God reflected in a variety of rabbinic texts.	GHK.13d Utilizes modern and contemporary thinkers to understand rabbinic theologies.

Differentiating Between Judaism and Other Religions	GHK.14a Recognizes that Judaism is a monotheistic religion.	GHK.14b Explains that different religions have different ways of describing God.	GHK.14c Identifies core Jewish beliefs and distinguishes them from non-Jewish beliefs.	GHK.14d Explains the difference between a rabbinic text that uses specific language to describe God and those that use philosophical abstraction.
Beliefs about God (Free Will)	GHK.15a Explores the concept that humans have the ability to make moral decisions.	GHK.15b Places the concept of free will in dialogue with conceptions of God.	GHK.15c Compares and contrasts the concept of human free will with the concept of divine omniscience and providence.	GHK.15d Evaluates various rabbinic approaches to theological dilemmas regarding free will
Beliefs about God (Immanence and Transcendence)	GHK.15e Identifies ways that God is everywhere and an overarching power; and, ways that God is close and personal as seen in rabbinic texts.	GHK.15f Describes the idea that God is everywhere and an overarching power; and, ways that God is close and personal as seen in rabbinic texts.	GHK.15g Distinguishes between the rabbinic notions of a God that is found everywhere and within the world, and a God that is outside and beyond the natural workings of the world or nature.	GHK.15h Uses the categories of immanence and transcendence to describe God's relationship to the world.
Beliefs about God (Modern/Postmodern Beliefs about a Non- Personal and Non- Supernatural God)				GHK.15i Explains modern/postmodern rabbinic beliefs about a non-personal and non- supernatural God.
Beliefs about God (Revelation)	GHK.15j Explores rabbinic stories about revelation.	GHK.15k Explains rabbinic understandings of revelation.	GHK.15I Compares and contrasts a variety of rabbinic understandings of revelation.	GHK.15m Utilizes modern/post-modern rabbinic texts to interpret rabbinic understandings of revelation.

Organizing Principle #1b: Rabbinic Theology: Challenges to Belief What challenges about belief in God do the rabbis raise? What solutions/responses do they propose?

Theme	K-2 Pre-Text	3-5 Beginning	6-8 Intermediate	9-12 Advanced
Theological Questions (Emerging from images of God) Theological Questions (Emerging from the Tanakh)	GHK.16a Formulates general questions about specific images of God.	GHK.16b Formulates specific questions about images of God found in a specific rabbinic text.  GHK.16e Identifies theological questions that the rabbis have about particular biblical texts.	GHK.16c Supports challenges to an image of God expressed in a particular rabbinic text. GHK.16f Explains theological questions that the rabbis have about particular biblical texts.	GHK.16d Explains modern/postmodern challenges to rabbinic images of God. GHK.16g Defines the challenges that the rabbis have with aspects of biblical theology.
Theological Questions (Emerging from the Jewish Historical Experience)			GHK.16h Describes a theological questions that the rabbis raise based on the historical experience of the Jewish people.	GHK.16i Utilizes modern and contemporary thinkers to support or challenge rabbinic responses to questions about God based on the Jewish historical experience.
Theological Questions (Emerging from Personal Experience)		GHK.16j Formulates "God feels distant when" statements.	GHK.16k Identifies theological questions raised by the rabbis emerging from personal experiences.	GHK.16l Utilizes modern and contemporary thinkers to support or challenge rabbinic responses to questions about God that emerge from personal experience.

Theological Questions (Mishna and Gemara)	GHK.16m Identifies questions that the rabbis have about God that are expressed in specific rabbinic texts.	GHK.16n Explains questions that the rabbis have about God that are expressed in specific rabbinic texts.	GHK.160 Explains theological categories that the rabbis identify as challenges to belief.
Theological Questions (Midrash and Aggadah)		GHK.16p Compares midrashim or aggadot that express a particular challenge to belief in God.	GHK.1q Articulates the way in which the rabbis use midrash and aggadah to express challenges or resolutions to questions about belief in God.
Theodicy	GHK.17a Provides examples of situations that give rise to the question, "Why doesn't God help everyone?"	GHK.17b Defines theodicy based on an exploration of rabbinic texts.	GHK.17c Explains how the concept of theodicy is a challenge to God.
Theodicy (cont.)	GHK.17d Summarizes rabbinic responses to the question "Why doesn't God help everyone?"	GHK.17e Explains a variety of rabbinic responses to theodicy.	GHK.17f Evaluates various rabbinic responses to suffering drawing on the writings of modern and contemporary thinkers.

#### Organizing Principle #1c: Rabbinic Theology: Personal Response

How can rabbinic theology support the development of my own theology?

How do I respond to rabbinic theological ideas that do not conform to my own beliefs or to my understanding of how God functions in the universe?

Theme	K-2	3-5	6-8	9-12
	Pre-Text	Beginning	Intermediate	Advanced
Experiencing God	GHK.18a Responds to the question, "When is God?" citing personal examples.	GHK.18b Formulates "God feels close when" statements.	GHK.18c Describes personally meaningful rabbinic beliefs about God that emerge from the rabbis' personal experiences.	
Experiencing God	GHK.18d Identifies moments when God feels/felt close.		GHK.18e Describes moments when God feels/felt close following the study of a rabbinic text that describes God as close.	GHK.18f Connects personal experiences of God with ideas expressed in rabbinic texts.
Personal Belief Statements (Images of God)	GHK.19a Utilizes specific rabbinic images of God in conversation.	GHK.19b Selects and describes personally meaningful rabbinic image/s of God.	GHK.19c Formulates a personal theology that engages with and responds to Rabbinic sources.	GHK.19d Applies ideas about God found in rabbinic texts to personal situations.
Personal Belief Statements (Challenges to Belief)		GHK.19e Expresses the challenges of building a relationship with God.	GHK.19f Compares rabbinic challenges to belief with personal challenges.	GHK.19g Proposes alternate ideas about God in response to theological challenges that arise from the study of rabbinic texts.

Personal Belief Statements (Constructing a Personal Theology)	GHK.19h Formulates "I believe that God" statements.	GHK.19i Constructs a personal statement of belief that is enriched by rabbinic sources.	GHK.19j Compares personally compelling belief statements raised in rabbinic literature explaining the implications of adopting a particular belief about God.	GHK.19k Formulates a personal theology utilizing ideas and images found in rabbinic texts (as supporting or rejected evidence).  Examples: sources may include classical, modern, and postmodern rabbinic perspectives
---	---	---	---	--

## Organizing Principle #2a: Covenant: God and Humanity How do the rabbis understand the relationship between God and humanity?

Theme	K-2	3-5	6-8	9-12
	Pre-Text	Beginning	Intermediate	Advanced
People as God's	GHK.20a Describes	GHK.20b Explains how a	GHK.20c Compares	GHK.20d Articulates the
Partner	individuals and activities that model partnering with God.	particular rabbinic text describes what it means to be God's partner.	multiple rabbinic texts about the divine-human relationship.	theological implications of multiple rabbinic conceptions of the divinehuman partnership.
Responsibility/	GHK.21a Articulates some	GHK.21b Articulates	GHK.21c Compares and	Articulates the theological
Obligation	responsibilities/ obligations of human beings in general.  Examples: sharing, being	rabbinic understandings of responsibilities/ obligations of human beings based upon particular rabbinic texts.	contrasts multiple rabbinic conceptions of the responsibilities/ obligations of human beings.	implications of multiple rabbinic conceptions of the responsibilities/ obligations of human beings.
	kind to others, being kind to animals		Examples: 7 mitzvot b'nai Noah	
<b>God's Relationship</b>	GHK.22a Explains that God	GHK.22b Describes	GHK.22c Explains rabbinic	GHK.22d Articulates the
with Non-Jews	values all people (Jewish and not Jewish).	rabbinic stories or practices that demonstrate God's concern for non-Jews.  Examples: God's anger at angels for singing Hallel	understandings of God's relationship to non-Jews.	theological, social, and moral implications of rabbinic understandings of God's relationship to non-Jews.
		when non-Jews destroyed		

# Organizing Principle #2b: Covenant: God and the Jewish People How do the rabbis understand the relationship between God and the Jewish people?

Theme	K-2 Pre-Text	3-5 Beginning	6-8 Intermediate	9-12 Advanced
Unique Relationship Between God and the Jewish People	GHK.23a Utilizes relational images of God found in rabbinic literature in describing the special relationship between God and the Jewish people.  Examples: God as judge, God acting with chesed	GHK.23b Explains a rabbinic midrash about God's unique relationship/partnership with central biblical figures.	GHK.23c Develops a description of God's unique relationship with the Jewish people drawing from rabbinic aggadot about God's relationship with particular rabbinic figures.	GHK.23d Utilizes modern/post-modern rabbinic texts to explain the relationship between the Jewish people and God.
Unique Relationship Between God and the Jewish People (Brit)	GHK.23e Explains the term brit using known examples.  Examples: Brit Milah	GHK.23f Identifies examples of brit.  Examples: Brit bein Habitarim, Shabbat	GHK.23g Defines rabbinic understandings of the concept of <i>brit</i> based upon rabbinic texts.	
Unique Relationship Between God and the Jewish People (Chosenness)	GHK.23h Explores midrashim in which Jews are called <i>am segulah</i> or <i>goy kadosh</i> .	GHK.23i Explains rabbinic notions of am segulah and goy kadosh and the obligations that emerge from having this status.	GHK.23j Explains rabbinic notions about the unique status of the Jewish people.	GHK.23k Articulates the moral, religious, societal, and individual implications of chosenness utilizing modern and postmodern rabbinic texts.

Understanding God's Will (Mitzvot)	GHK.24a Articulates that God has unique expectations for the Jewish people.	GHK.24b Articulates rabbinic understandings of brit sinai and its implications for Jews' responsibilities/ obligations to God based upon particular rabbinic texts.	GHK.24c Compares and contrasts a variety of rabbinic perspectives about Jews' responsibilities/ obligations to God based upon particular rabbinic texts.	GHK.24d Analyzes the connection between obligations to God and different conceptions of brit and mitzvot.
Understanding God's Will (Rabbinic Conceptions of Authority)	GHK.24e Explains ways that God teaches Jews what God wants from us.	GHK.24f Distinguishes between Torah she'bichtav and Torah she'be'al peh.	GHK.24g Compares and contrasts rabbinic understandings of the relationship between Torah she'bichtav and Torah she'be'al peh.	GHK.24h Utilizes modern/post-modern rabbinic texts to interpret rabbinic understandings of the relationship between Torah she'bichtav and Torah she'be'al peh.
Understanding God's Will (Rabbinic Conceptions of Authority)		GHK.24i Explains a rabbinic perspective about the relationship between human and divine authority over determining Jewish obligations and God's will based on the examination of a particular rabbinic text.	GHK.24j Compares the implications of a variety of rabbinic perspectives about the relationship between human and divine authority over determining Jewish obligations and God's will.	GHK.24k Utilizes modern/post-modern rabbinic texts to explain the role that people play in the interpretation of God's will.
Challenging God	GHK.25a Articulates that Jews have a voice in our relationship with God.	GHK.25b Explains midrashim and aggadot in which biblical and rabbinic figures challenge God.		

# Organizing Principle #2c: Covenant: Personal response How do rabbinic conceptions of covenant inform the way I understand my relationship with God?

Theme	K-2 Pre-Text	3-5 Beginning	6-8 Intermediate	9-12 Advanced
My Partnership with God		GHK.26a Brainstorms personal opportunities to be in partnership with God.	GHK.26b Develops a personal stance regarding being God's partner.	GHK.26c Develops a personal stance about being a part of the covenant with God based in rabbinic literature.
My Unique Relationship with God	GHK.27a Identifies times in our lives we encounter brit Examples: brit mila	GHK.27b Explains how specific personal encounters with brit are/were an opportunity to re/affirm a personal relationship with God.	GHK.27c Develops a personal stance regarding revelation and authority based on ideas described in rabbinic literature.	GHK.27d Articulates a personal understanding of the concept of chosenness informed by ideas in rabbinic literature.

Organizing Principle #3: Rabbinic Conceptions of Holiness/Kedushah
How do the rabbis describe encounters with kedushah?
How do the rabbis create sacred time and sacred space?
How do they envision the sacredness found in nature and in people?

Theme	K-2 Pre-Text	3-5 Beginning	6-8 Intermediate	9-12 Advanced
Sacred Space	GHK.30a Identifies ritual objects and activities that make a space holy.	GHK.30b Describes qualities that make a space holy based on an exploration of a rabbinic text.	GHK.30c Justifies where sacred activities can and cannot take place citing evidence from rabbinic texts.	GHK.30d Articulates underlying concepts in examples of sacred space.
	Examples: objects: Torah, mezuzah; activities: prayer, study	Examples: makom tefillah, beit midrash, bayit, Eretz Yisrael, Yerushalayim, Mishkan/Beit HaMikdash, (i.e. sugyot from end of ketubot about aliyah from Bavel to Israel and burial in Israel)		Examples: kapandaria - not taking a short cut in a synagogue
Sacred Time	GHK.31a Explains things we do on Shabbat that help make Shabbat holy.	GHK.31b Describes the elements that make a particular moment on the Jewish ritual calendar holy.	GHK.31c Explains rabbinic conceptions of <i>kedushat hazman</i> .  Examples: kiddush, havdalah, testifying about seeing the new moon	GHK.31d Compares and contrasts the various conceptions and levels of holy time.  Examples: Shabbat, Chag, Chol Hamoed, Rosh Chodesh

14

Holiness in Self and Others	GHK.32a Explains the concept of b'tzelem e-lohim.	GHK.32b Connects particular attributes of God to human behaviors or actions.	GHK.32c Draws on multiple rabbinic texts to articulate a personal approach to seeing kedushah in oneself and in others.	GHK.32d Applies the concept of b'tzelem e-lohim or imitatio dei to the development of a personal spiritual practice around the holiness of self and others.
Natural World	GHK.33a Expresses awe, wonder, and curiosity about the natural world.	GHK.33b Selects and recites brachot to express awe and wonder about the natural world.  Examples: birchot hanehnim	GHK.33c Connects rabbinic names or metaphors for God to corresponding phenomenon in nature.  Examples: yotzer hameorot	GHK.33d Incorporates rabbinic texts about God in the natural world into development of personal beliefs about God.
Responsibility for the Environment	GHK.34a Describes how people take care of the earth and why it is important.	GHK.34b Explains a rabbinic concept connected to taking care of the environment described in a particular text.  Examples: ba'al tashchit, tza'ar ba'alei chayim	GHK.34c Examines a variety of rabbinic conceptions of human responsibility for the world.  Examples: shemitah, yovel	GHK.34d Compares rabbinic conceptions of being stewards of the earth with contemporary Jewish theology about the environment.
Finding God in Nature	GHK.35a Responds to the question, "Where can we God in nature?" with specific examples.	GHK.35b Explains rabbinic conceptions of daily miracles.	GHK.35c Explains rabbinic conceptions about God's relationship to the natural world.	GHK.35d Examines rabbinic conceptions of how God is revealed and concealed through nature.  Examples: destructive forces in nature

Organizing Principle #4: Religious Practices that Connect us to God

What religious practices connect us to God?

How do we balance our need to nurture our spiritual selves with other needs and responsibilities?

How do the rabbis envision a life of study (talmud torah), worship (avodah) and action (gemilut hasadim and mitzvot)?

How can I incorporate these practices into my life?

Theme	K-2 Pre-Text	3-5 Beginning	6-8 Intermediate	9-12 Advanced
Prayer (as Spiritual Practice)	GHK.40a Relates the recitation of a particular bracha to a special moment or important value.	GHK.40b Explains how daily recitation of a particular prayer can remind us about things that we value	GHK.40c Differentiates between keva (fixed prayer) and kavana (spontaneous prayer).	GHK.40d Evaluates the pros and cons of fixed and spontaneous prayer.
Prayer (Categories)		GHK.40e Connects the categories of rabbinic prayer to particular personal/communal experiences.  Examples: shevach, bakasha and hoda'ah)	GHK.40f Describes the relationship between God and people through the language and prayers of of the rabbis.  Examples: bracha formula (second person singular to third person plural)	

Prayer (Efficacy and Purpose)	GHK.40g Recites and explains the purpose of mi sheberach l'cholim.	GHK.40h Summarizes a rabbinic concept regarding appropriate and inappropriate moments for making requests of God.  Examples: house on fire, not sure if it is yours, cannot pray that it is not yours because it is already happening (Mishna Berachot)	GHK.40i Compares a variety of descriptions about the purposes of individual or communal prayer found in rabbinic texts.  Examples: Ta'anit for lack of rain	GHK.40j Responds to the varied opinions about the efficacy of prayer found in rabbinic texts.
Talmud Torah	GHK.41a Describes what makes talmud torah time special.	GHK.41b Infers the messages of the importance of talmud torah in connecting people to God and kedushah from aggadot about the rabbis.  Examples: Pirkei Avot: questions God asks at the end of your life - did you make time to study Torah?	GHK.41c Draws upon rabbinic sources (halachic and aggadic) to describe rabbinic conceptions of study as a path to encountering the Divine.	GHK.41d Articulates a personal understanding of the sacredness of talmud torah drawing ideas from rabbinic texts.
Ritual Mitzvot (mitzvot bein adam I'makom)	GHK.42a Explains how ritual practices build our connections to God/Kedusha.	GHK.42b Explains the symbolic/religious meaning of a particular ritual mitzvah.	GHK.42c Describes how the performance of ritual mitzvot help to build a relationship with God.	GHK.42d Utilizes rabbinic texts in describing the connection between performing mitzvot and building a relationship with God.

Gemilut Hasadim	GHK.43a Identifies acts of kindness that bring God/Kedushah into the world.	GHK.43b Explains the concepts of <i>chesed</i> and <i>tzedakah</i> .	GHK.43c Draws on rabbinic literature to describe how the performance of <i>gemilut hasadim</i> helps people to build a personal relationship with God.	GHK.43d Describes how participation in acts of social justice reflect a relationship with God and kedushah.
Balancing Spiritual and Practical Obligations			GHK.44a Formulates a personal model for balancing spiritual and practical obligations.  Examples: talmud torah and earning a living; talmud torah and action (ma'asim); maximum limits to giving tzedakah	GHK.44b Compares various approaches to balancing spiritual and practical obligations found in rabbinic literature.  Examples: debates about circumstances when it is permissible to shorten or abstain from prayer
Making Spiritual Practices Personal	GHK.45a Tells about a spiritual practice that was experienced at home or at school.	GHK.45b Defends the value of a particular spiritual practice incorporating rabbinic views encountered in a text.	GHK.45c Designs a plan for engaging in a personal or communal religious/spiritual practice that is supported by rabbinic texts.  Examples: personal approach to Torah study, tefillah, Performance of ethical/ritual mitzvot	GHK.45d Integrates rabbinic discussions on the values and barriers that influence the efficacy of a particular practice as a way of connecting to God when formulating a personal approach to spiritual practice.  Examples: regular tefillah as lifting us up from the mundane and the danger of it becoming too routine

William Davidson Graduate School of Jewish Education

### Legacy Heritage Instructional Leadership Institute



### **Halakhic Development**

Students will learn to trace the development of halakhic topics, analyze considerations that inform halakhic decision-making, and develop an appreciation for the importance of the practice and study of halakhah in Jewish life.

Jewish law is a window on Jewish history, religion and religious philosophy. Jewish law is a treasure trove of information about all aspects of Jewish daily life throughout the ages in every kind of circumstance - tranquility and persecution, prosperity and calamity, ascent and decline. (Menachem Elon, Jewish Law: History, Sources, Principles, Volume I, p. xlvii)

Halakhah is a critical form of Jewish engagement with the world. More than just a legal system, halakhah is a language Jews have used to craft an understanding of how best to live according to God's will. Like all languages, it is shaped by tradition and characterized by continuity while also being dynamic and adapting to changing circumstances. It possesses a grammar of its own that governs expression and facilitates conversation. Halakhah allows for a wide range of opinions and perspectives on Jewish practice. Throughout history, committed communities and *poskim* (halakhic decisors) have engaged with the core texts of our tradition to address the personal, communal, national and religious issues of their day.

Successful implementation of this standard will result in learners who can speak the language of halakhah. They will be familiar with major halakhic works and thinkers that span the course of Jewish history. Students will be able to articulate sophisticated understandings of the nature of rabbinic authority in Jewish law and practice, the mechanisms and modes of halakhic decision-making, and the values (which can sometimes be in tension with one another) that have driven the development of Jewish law over time. They will participate in informed conversations about halakhic development, acquire tools for assessing legal decisions, and develop a deeper appreciation for how halakhah can inform and enrich their lives.

DRAFT DOCUMENT NOT FOR DISTRIBUTION

#### **Halakhic Development**

**Standard:** Students will learn to trace the development of halakhic topics, analyze considerations that inform halakhic decision-making, and develop an appreciation for the importance of the practice and study of halakhah in Jewish life.

#### Preamble:

Jewish law is a window on Jewish history, religion and religious philosophy. Jewish law is a treasure trove of information about all aspects of Jewish daily life throughout the ages in every kind of circumstance - tranquility and persecution, prosperity and calamity, ascent and decline. (Menachem Elon, <u>Jewish Law: History, Sources, Principles</u>, Volume I, p. xlvii)

Halakhah is a critical form of Jewish engagement with the world. More than just a legal system, halakhah is a language Jews have used to craft an understanding of how best to live according to God's will. Like all languages, it is shaped by tradition and characterized by continuity while also being dynamic and adapting to changing circumstances. It possesses a grammar of its own that governs expression and facilitates conversation. Halakhah allows for a wide range of opinions and perspectives on Jewish practice. Throughout history, committed communities and *poskim* (halakhic decisors) have engaged with the core texts of our tradition to address the personal, communal, national and religious issues of their day.

Successful implementation of this standard will result in learners who can speak the language of halakhah. They will be familiar with major halakhic works and thinkers that span the course of Jewish history. Students will be able to articulate sophisticated understandings of the nature of rabbinic authority in Jewish law and practice, the mechanisms and modes of halakhic decision-making, and the values (which can sometimes be in tension with one another) that have driven the development of Jewish law over time. They will participate in informed conversations about halakhic development, acquire tools for assessing legal decisions, and develop a deeper appreciation for how halakhah can inform and enrich their lives.

#### **Organizing Principles:**

- 1. Major works and periods: What are the unique features of major halakhic works?

  Students will develop a familiarity with major texts of halakhic literature: their time, place, historical context, and authors (when relevant); their genres (e.g. Codes vs. Responsa; Midrash Halakhah vs. Mishnah); and the relationships between them (e.g. Shulhan Arukh's relationship to the Rif, Rambam, and Tur).
- 2. Tracing halakhic topics: How do I follow the development of a halakhic idea or ruling over time?

  Students will develop the ability to follow a halakhic topic beginning at any point on the halakhic trajectory and trace it forward and/or backward through the sources.
- 3. Considerations that inform halakhic decision making: How do the rabbis and later poskim interpret sources to derive Jewish law? What principles guide the work of the rabbis and later poskim in interpreting Jewish law? Poskim throughout the ages have used a variety of tools to guide their work of interpreting sources and deciding Jewish law. They often manage apparent contradictions between biblical and rabbinic sources, and issue rulings for situations that previous sources do not address. Students will encounter many considerations that are at play in making halakhic decisions such as procedural (e.g. yachid ve'rabim, hilkheta kevatrai) and interpretive (e.g. kal va-homer, ein li ela, ribui and miut) rules as well as the values, considerations of social context and issues of authority that guide halakhic interpretation.
- 4. Understanding and relating to rabbinic authority: How did the rabbis understand and explain the source and scope of their authority? How do we, as individuals and communities, situate ourselves and our practices in relation to the halakhic conversation?
  - Students will explore the scope of authority as the rabbis understood it and consider the implications of these understandings for today. Through an exploration of rabbinic texts that address issues of authority and pluralism, students are invited to consider the system of halakhah as a whole rather than through its component parts as in the preceding Organizing Principles.

#### **Benchmarks**

## Organizing Principle #1: Major works and periods What are the unique features of major halakhic works?

Theme	K-2 Pre-Text	3-5 Beginning	6-8 Intermediate	9-12 Advanced
Key Works of Halakhic Literature		HD.10a Recognizes key works of halakhah as sources of Jewish laws and practices.	HD.10b Categorizes major works of rabbinic literature by genre.	HD.10c Sorts major works of rabbinic literature into chronological sequence.
		Examples: Mishnah, Gemara, Mishneh Torah, Shul <u>h</u> an Arukh.	Examples: Halakhah vs. Aggadah, Codes vs. Responsa vs. Commentary, etc.	Examples: Midrash, Mishnah, Talmudim (Eretz Yisrael and Bavel)
Genre	HD.11a Differentiates between practices, laws, and narratives found in Torah from those found in rabbinic literature.	HD.11b Distinguishes between aggadah and halakhah in a piece of rabbinic literature.	HD.11c Explains the role of a ma'aseh in a mishnah as illustrating and clarifying a halakhah.	HD.11d Explains different ways that major halakhic works are organized, and the significance of those differences.
	Examples: לך לך vs. Abraham and idols; resting on Shabbat vs. saying kiddush and lighting candles			Examples: Mishneh Torah vs. Tur/Shulhan Arukh; Rif vs. Codes

Genre (cont.)		HD.11e Distinguishes between a biblical and rabbinic interpretation of a biblical verse.	HD.11f Identifies relationship of a commentary to its base text.	HD.11g Compares select broad approaches to p'sak halakhah.
		Examples: kid goat in mother's milk vs. milk and meat	Examples: explaining vs. challenging vs. giving the sources	Examples: Shulhan Arukh's "best two out of three," Rama's regard for minhag) Sepharad vs. Ashkenaz - different methodologies, attitudes towards codes, attitudes towards practice vs. text, weight of different authorities, etc.
Key Rabbinic	HD.12a Retells	HD.12b Contrasts	HD.12c Matches	HD.12d Names the
Figures	stories about key figures found in rabbinic texts.	key rabbinic figures in meaningful ways.	major works of rabbinic literature with the appropriate class of rabbis.	authors of major works of halakhic literature.
	Examples: Hillel on the roof, Rabbi Akiva's humble beginnings, Rabbi Shimon bar Yo <u>h</u> ai in the cave	Examples: Hillel and Shammai; Note: the goal is to begin learning to abstract an approach from a personality	Examples: tannaim, amoraim, rishonim	Examples: שולחן ערוך, משנה תורה, ארבעה טורים, etc.

# Organizing Principle #2: Tracing halakhic topics How do I follow the development of a halakhic idea or ruling over time?

Thomas	и э	2.5	6.0	0.13
Theme	K-2	3-5	6-8	9-12
	Pre-Text	Beginning	Intermediate	Advanced
Locating &		HD.20a Locates a	HD.20b Locates a	HD.20c Distinguishes
Navigating Mishnah		mishnah in a given	mishnah from a full set of	between tannaitic
		masekhet by mar'eh	the Mishnah when given	and amoraic
		makom (perek and	a mar'eh makom.	statements on a
		mishnah).		page of Talmud.
			Examples: masekhet,	
			perek and mishnah	
Locating &			HD.21a Locates a page of	HD.21b Uses the עין
<b>Navigating Gemara</b>			printed Talmud by	משפט נר מצוה, תורה אור
311 311			mar'eh makom	מסורת הש"ס and, השלם
			mentioned in another	on a page of Talmud to
			source.	identify related material
				in Tanakh, other sugyot
			<b>Examples:</b> masekhet, daf	and codes.
			and <i>amud</i>	
Locating &		HD.22a Locates a section	HD.22b Locates a section	HD.22c Locates a section
<b>Navigating Halakhic</b>		of Mishneh Torah by	of Shul <u>h</u> an Arukh by	of Arukh Hashul <u>h</u> an and
Works		mar'eh makom.	mar'eh makom.	Mishnah Berurah by
VVOIRS				mar'eh makom.
		Examples: hilkhot X,	Examples: volume,	
		perek, halakhah	siman, se'if	Examples: volume,
				siman, se'if, or siman,
				se'if, se'if katan

Researching Topics in Rabbinic Literature	HD.23a Matches/Connects/ Names basic themes and subject matter to each of the six orders of the Mishnah.	HD.23b Names basic themes and subject matter connected to each of the six orders of the Mishnah.	HD.23c Selects the proper masekhet when exploring a particular halakhic question.
Researching Topics in Halakhic Literature		HD.24a Knows which subsections are located in each <i>sefer</i> of Rambam.  Examples: מאכלות אסורות, איסורי ביאה, שחיטה, קדושה	HD.24b Given a broad topic to locate can find it in Shulhan Arukh and/or Mishneh Torah.  Examples: Hilkhot Aveilut
Key Halakhic Vocabulary	HD.25a Defines key halakhic terminology.  Examples: בית דין, מחמיר; חייב, פטור, לכתחילה, בדיעבד	HD.25b Applies halakhic terminology to new situations/scenarios.  Examples: Which opinion in a:ב משנה מגילה ב:ג is most מחמיר?	
Key Halakhic Concepts	HD.26a Explains a particular halakhic concept.  Examples: pikuah nefesh, sha'at had'hak, kevod ha'briyot, kavod hatzibbur, mitzvot aseh she'hazman gramah	HD.26b Explains a halakhic concept used as a justification for changing or adapting a law in a specific scenario.  Examples: Hearing aids on Shabbat ( <i>Tzitz Eliezer</i> 6:6:3)	HD.26c Traces the changing application of a particular halakhic concept over time.  Examples: see Rabbi Dov Linzer on "omer mutar" article

Development of Halakhah Over Time	HD.27a Explains that Chazal often elaborates details of laws written in the Torah.	HD.27b Compares biblical laws on a given topic to rabbinic laws on that same topic.	HD.27c Compares a section of Talmud to its conclusion in the Mishneh Torah.	HD.27d Compares a section of Talmud to its conclusion in later halakhic sources.
	Examples: melachot shabbat, sukkah, Pesach seder, בסוכות תשבו	Examples: hashavat aveidah, kashrut, minimum/maximum heights of a sukkah		Examples: Shul <u>h</u> an Arukh, Responsa Literature
Development of Halakhah Over Time (cont.)		HD.28a Describes how a specific Jewish practice has changed from the Bible to the Mishnah.	HD.28b Examines how a specific Jewish practice changed from the Bible through the Gemara using textual citations.	HD.28c Traces the development of a law from the Humash, through a Talmudic sugya, through Rishonim and Codes, including
		Examples: Arba minim - waving around the altar in beit hamikdash to practice in synagogues today, Pri Etz Hadar M Sukkah 3:4	Examples: Announcing Rosh Hodesh and fixing the start dates of the holidays	Rambam, Shul <u>h</u> an Arukh, Mishnah Berurah, contemporary teshuvot.

Organizing Principle #3: Considerations that inform halakhic decision making

How do the rabbis and later poskim interpret sources to derive Jewish law?

What principles guide the work of the rabbis and later poskim in interpreting Jewish law?

Theme	K-2	3-5	6-8	9-12
	Pre-Text	Beginning	Intermediate	Advanced
Sources and Categories of Law		HD.30a Identifies whether a particular law appears in the Torah or only in rabbinic texts.  Note: this is different from d'oraita versus d'rabbanan; i.e. the prohibition to write on Shabbat does not appear in the Torah, but is considered d'oraita	HD.30b Explains the halakhic significance of whether a law is categorized as d'oraita or d'rabbanan.  Examples: pat akum and the takkanot mipnei tikkun olam in the 4th and 5th perek of Gittin	HD.30b Distinguishes between halakhah (a practice stemming from Torah or rabbis) and minhag (a practice stemming from popular custom).
Procedural Considerations/ Mechanisms of P'sak (Authority)	HD.31a Describes different ways that rules are made.	HD.31b Compares the authority various halakhic decisors give to particular sources.  Examples: Bavli vs. Yerushalmi, Tosefta; weight of Shulhan Arukh, Rambam.	HD.31c Describes the authority that various communities placed on different sources.  Examples: Ashkenaz, Sefard, Yemenite in terms of weight of certain sources (e.g., Rambam); some Rishonim/Achronim weigh more than others.	HD.31d Examines procedures and mechanisms of halakhic decision making in primary halakhic and talmudic texts.  Examples: yachid ve'rabim, hilcheta kevatrai

Procedural Considerations/ Mechanisms of P'sak (Hermeneutics/ Rules of Interpretation)		HD.32a Explains the interpretive rules at play in a particular halakhic decision.	HD.32b Describes an example of a biblical verse used as a legal source based on a non-p'shat reading of that verse.
interpretation		Examples: kal va-homer, ein li ela, ribui and miut	<b>Examples:</b> Meat and milk " <i>lo tevashel gedi b'halev imo</i> "
Procedural Considerations/ Mechanisms of P'sak (Social Context)		HD.33a Explains how individual <i>poskim</i> handle contradictions between the textual tradition and lived practice/social customs.	HD.33b Identifies the impact of the social/cultural/historical context of a problem that the rabbis are addressing.
		Examples: הלכה ואין מורין כן אם אין נביאים הם, בני נביאים הם, מנהג מבטל תורה	Examples: Changes in the way the category of חרש is viewed; halakhot on pidyon shvuyim, chalav Yisrael or chalav stam taking modern FDA regulations into account

Procedural Considerations/ Mechanisms of P'sak (Rabbinic Values)		HD.34a Identifies rabbinic values used in halakhic decision making in a rabbinic text.	HD.34b Analyzes a teshuvah to explain the communal values supporting the rabbinic response.	HD.34c Predicts the value considerations that will be used in a response to a particular halakhic question.
		Examples: kavod ha'briyot, lo ta'amod al dam re'echah, mipnei darkei shalom, mipnei tikkun olam, hefsed merubeh	Examples: communal considerations like v'chai bahem, ein gozrin gezeirah elah im kein rov hatzibbur yachol la'amod, puk chazi	
Formulating Halakhic Decisions	HD.35a Formulates exceptions to rules.	HD.35b Describes tensions between competing values that guide halakhic decision making.  Examples: diversity vs. unity; creativity/ flexibility vs. tradition/stability; communal vs. individual interests; mimetic vs. text-based	HD.35c Uses understanding of halakhic methods and approaches to challenge or defend a halakhic ruling.	HD.35d Formulates a halakhic decision to a real or imagined scenario using halakhic methodology.  Examples: communal interests vs. individual interests"

Organizing Principle #4: Understanding and relating to Rabbinic Authority

How did the rabbis understand and explain the source and scope of their authority?

How do we, as individuals and communities, situate ourselves and our practices in relation to the halakhic conversation?

Theme	K-2 Pre-Text	3-5 Beginning	6-8 Intermediate	9-12 Advanced
Who/what are rabbis?	HD.40a Identifies people to whom they turn for help with problemsolving.	HD.40b Identifies important characteristics of problem-solvers.	HD.40c Contrasts different ways in which leaders attain their role or status.	HD.40d Contrasts rabbinic leadership with previous forms of Jewish leadership.
	Examples: teachers, doctors, etc.	Examples: listening, asking questions, being fair, etc.	Examples: heredity, knowledge, charisma, judgment, etc.	Examples: priestly, prophetic, royal, origins of term "rabbi"
Authority	HD.41a Explains the purpose of rules in our lives.  Examples: Jewish and secular rules like rules for "morning meeting", laws about crossing the street	HD.41b Explains halakhic decision making as the rabbis' attempt to understand and implement God's will.	HD.41c Contrasts different approaches to rabbinic authority.  Examples: Arukh HaShulhan & Tosafot vs. Mishnah Berurah; Orthodox, Conservative and Reform	HD.41d Compares halakhic decision-making with decision-making in other legal frameworks.

Scope and Limits of Authority	HD.42a Retells a rabbinic story about authority and its limits found in rabbinic texts.	HD.42b Extracts general principles from core aggadot that present central ideas about the origins and scope of rabbinic authority.	HD.42c Analyzes primary rabbinic texts to discuss rabbinic views of the origins and scope of Rabbinic authority.	HD.42d Critiques and defends the power of rabbinic authority.
	Examples: Rabban Gamliel and Rabbi Yehoshua, Moshe in Rabbi Akiva's beit midrash, etc.	Examples: Moshe in R. Akiva's beit midrash; tanur shel Akhnai)	Examples: bracha ner Hanukkah ( Shabbat 21b); "לא תסור" (Shabbat 23a); "שמע בני מוסר אביך" (Pesachim 50b)	Examples: the idea, found in Rashi, that לא applies even if rabbis insist right is left and left is right)
Pluralism		HD.43a Identifies areas in which different communities have divergent practices.  Examples: Sepharad and Ashkenaz	HD.43b Contrasts Pharisees with Sadducees, and/or Rabbinites with Karaites, based on primary texts.	
Reflecting on the Role of Halakhah in Judaism		HD.44a Discusses the personal importance of halakhah in student's own life.  Examples: significance of idea of divine law in human hands; halakhic development over time	HD.44b Defends or critiques the centrality of practice and study of halakhah in Jewish life.  Examples: ותלמוד תורה כנגד כולם, גדול תלמוד המביא לידי מעשה	HD.44c Compares the role of halakhah in Judaism to the role of practice in other religions.

Personal Reflection on Halakhic Development	HD.45a Describes the advantages and disadvantages of preserving multiple opinions.	HD.45b Evaluates the importance and challenge of working to maintain continuity with an ancient/timeless	HD.45c Articulates the qualities of a good posek.  Examples: How does one balance boldness
		system of practice.	and caution? How important is external scientific knowledge?, etc.

William Davidson Graduate School of Jewish Education

### Legacy Heritage Instructional Leadership Institute



## **Jewish Identity and Practice**

Students will develop a rich and nuanced understanding of themselves as Jews and shape their commitments to Jewish practice through a deep engagement with rabbinic teachings and texts.

We aspire for Jewish learning to be transformative, to shape both personality and behavior, who we are and what we do. As the rabbis said, גדול תלמוד המביא לידי מעשה , "Most important is study, which leads to action" (TB Kiddushin 30b). Our actions help to fashion our identity, that, is how we think about who we are in the world. To put it in other words, running makes me a runner, singing makes me a singer, engaging in Jewish practice makes me Jewish. As Sefer Hahinukh says, בל אדם נפעל כפי פעולותיו, "A person is formed by his/her actions." Living an examined life requires constantly looking at the relationship between who we say we are, and what it is that we do. The relationship works in both directions: identity influences practice, and habitual practice influences our identity.

This standard offers students the opportunity to develop a deep understanding of what it means to be Jewish and to cultivate reflective Jewish practice. The title of this standard intentionally includes the word identity. By "identity," we mean self-understanding—the holistic way we see ourselves. By "practice," we mean a broad collection of behaviors, including family customs and traditions, mitzvot, and general engagement with the broader Jewish community. Studying rabbinic literature through this standard builds a deep understanding of Jewish practice, enriches personal growth, and fosters a commitment to engaged Jewish living. Students will study the origins and development of Jewish ritual and interpersonal practices and discern the ways rabbinic literature can inform a developing self understanding as students develop a sense of who they are and who they want to be.

Through the lens of this standard, students will closely examine Jewish practices that fall into two main categories - bein adam l'makom and bein adam l'havero. We use Jewish ritual practices to mean those practices that fall into the category of mitzvot bein adam l'makom, those practices we use to connect us to God and Judaism as a religion. Interpersonal practices are those that fall into the category of mitzvot bein adam l'havero. Those practices that guide our behavior and direct the way human beings relate one to the other. We have chosen the

DRAFT DOCUMENT NOT FOR DISTRIBUTION

term "interpersonal" as opposed to "ethical" to stay true to the rabbinic category of mitzvot bein adam l'havero. One could make the argument that one goal of the establishment of the ritual and interpersonal practices was to infuse Jewish life with ethics. Each generation will develop its own understandings of ethical, and if we take seriously that the rabbis were working to build a model ethical society, it is incumbent on each generation to understand the ethical lessons behind the ritual and interpersonal commandments.

Identity formation requires both introspection and encounters with external ideas, texts, and practices. Students will develop the knowledge, skills and dispositions necessary to draw from Jewish principles found in rabbinic literature, as they make decisions about how and when to act in this world based on a reflective study of rabbinic texts. The Identity and Practice standard focuses on the individual student, while also being mindful of the communal aspect of Jewish study: the encounter with rabbinic texts will influence their sense of connection to their community, and help them to build and contribute to vibrant Jewish communities.

#### **Jewish Identity and Practice**

**Standard:** Students will develop a rich and nuanced understanding of themselves as Jews and shape their commitments to Jewish practice through a deep engagement with rabbinic teachings and texts.

#### Preamble:

We aspire for Jewish learning to be transformative, to shape both personality and behavior, who we are and what we do. As the rabbis said, גדול תלמוד המביא לידי מעשה , "Most important is study, which leads to action" (TB Kiddushin 30b). Our actions help to fashion our identity, that, is how we think about who we are in the world. To put it in other words, running makes me a runner, singing makes me a singer, engaging in Jewish practice makes me Jewish. As Sefer Hahinukh says, כל אדם נפעל כפי פעולותיו, "A person is formed by his/her actions." Living an examined life requires constantly looking at the relationship between who we say we are, and what it is that we do. The relationship works in both directions: identity influences practice, and habitual practice influences our identity.

This standard offers students the opportunity to develop a deep understanding of what it means to be Jewish and to cultivate reflective Jewish practice. The title of this standard intentionally includes the word identity. By "identity," we mean self-understanding—the holistic way we see ourselves. By "practice," we mean a broad collection of behaviors, including family customs and traditions, mitzvot, and general engagement with the broader Jewish community. Studying rabbinic literature through this standard builds a deep understanding of Jewish practice, enriches personal growth, and fosters a commitment to engaged Jewish living. Students will study the origins and development of Jewish ritual and interpersonal practices and discern the ways rabbinic literature can inform a developing self-understanding as students develop a sense of who they are and who they want to be.

Through the lens of this standard, students will closely examine Jewish practices that fall into two main categories - bein adam I'makom and bein adam I'havero. We use Jewish ritual practices to mean those practices that fall into the category of mitzvot bein adam I'makom, those practices we use to connect us to God and Judaism as a religion. Interpersonal practices are those that fall into the category of mitzvot bein adam I'havero. Those practices that guide our behavior and direct the way human beings relate one to the other. We have chosen the term "interpersonal" as opposed to "ethical" to stay true to the rabbinic category of mitzvot bein adam I'havero. One could make the argument that one goal of the establishment of the ritual and interpersonal practices was to infuse Jewish life with ethics. Each generation will develop its own understandings of ethical, and if we take seriously that the rabbis were working to build a model ethical society, it is incumbent on each generation to understand the ethical lessons behind the ritual and interpersonal commandments.

Identity formation requires both introspection and encounters with external ideas, texts, and practices. Students will develop the knowledge, skills and dispositions necessary to draw from Jewish principles found in rabbinic literature, as they make decisions about how and when to act in this world based on a reflective study of rabbinic texts. The Identity and Practice standard focuses on the individual student, while also being mindful of the communal aspect of Jewish study: the encounter with rabbinic texts will influence their sense of connection to their community, and help them to build and contribute to vibrant Jewish communities.

### **Organizing Principles:**

- 1. Encountering and analyzing rabbinic texts, teachings and practices: What are Jewish ritual/spiritual (bein adam l'makom) and interpersonal (bein adam l'havero) practices? How does an exploration of their roots in rabbinic literature expand and deepen our understanding of these practices?
  - During the K-2 band, students will build a vocabulary around Jewish interpersonal and ritual practices through stories, experiences, discussion, and exploring ritual artifacts. As students move towards reading the texts of rabbinic literature, they will expand their foundational knowledge through the exploration of fundamental conceptual categories through which to analyze practice. As they identify core value concepts both animating and emerging from rabbinic texts, they will discover the origins of the intellectual and spiritual roots of Jewish tradition and contemporary Jewish ritual and interpersonal practices, and come to understand the ways that rituals develop and change over time.
- 2. Building personal connections with Jewish practices: How does the performance of practices, both interpersonal and ritual, shape our understanding of ourselves? How does engaging in Jewish practices help us build a connection to Judaism? How do we develop personal responses and make meaning of Jewish practices?
  - As part of the encounter with rabbinic texts, students will explore ways that ritual and practice impact their sense of connection to Judaism and the Jewish community. Through engagement with diverse opinions and voices within texts and practices, and an exploration of the role that contemporary issues and modern sensibilities play in the formulation of ritual and interpersonal practices, students will develop the capacity to engage in a personal and meaningful way with Jewish practice. Students will explore how rabbinic categories like <u>hesed</u>, mishpat, tzedakah, tzedek, emet, shalom portray how we should act in the world.
- 3. Expressing Jewish Identity through practice: How do we enact interpersonal and ritual practices in our lives? What criteria do we use to make decisions about which Jewish practices we choose to take on?
  - Students in the earlier bands focus on connecting rabbinic categories and teachings to their own current practices. As students progress, they will acquire the knowledge, skills and dispositions to make increasingly independent, sophisticated, and reasoned decisions about which practices they will enact in their own lives, now and in the future, and how those practices both shape and reflect their identity.

### **Benchmarks**

Organizing Principle #1: Encountering and analyzing rabbinic texts, teachings and practices

What are Jewish ritual/spiritual (bein adam l'makom) and interpersonal (bein adam l'havero) practices?

How does an exploration of their roots in rabbinic literature expand and deepen our understanding of these practices?

-	V 2		_ ·	
Theme	K-2	3-5	6-8	9-12
	Pre-Text	Beginning	Intermediate	Advanced
<b>Explaining Rabbinic</b>	JIP.10a Incorporates	JIP.10b Retells the central	JIP.10c Summarizes the	JIP.10d Applies the central
Texts	appropriate terminology	idea of a simple rabbinic	questions, proofs,	idea of a rabbinic text to a
- CAGO	into speech and play.	text.	arguments, and	familiar circumstance.
			vocabulary within a	
			complex rabbinic text.	
Ritual Vocabulary	JIP.11a Connects ritual	JIP.11b Describes a	JIP.11c Explains	JIP.11d Compares multiple
•	objects and actions to a	selected ritual or practice	increasingly complicated	rabbinic texts on a
	particular ritual practices.	found in rabbinic texts,	rituals and practices using	particular ritual to develop
		employing rabbinic terms	textual support from	a nuanced description of
	Examples: shofar to Rosh	and phrases to describe	rabbinic sources.	the practice.
	Hashanah, reciting	component parts.		
	kiddush and lighting			
	candles to welcoming	Examples: fasting on Yom	Examples: death and	Examples: synthesizes
	Shabbat	Kippur, species in a lulav	mourning (shomrim,	information from sugyot in
			hesped, shiva)	Bavli Brachot, Shabbat,
			Inclusion or omission of	and <i>Megillah</i> on when and
			particular prayers in	why you say Hallel
			tefillot depending on	
			calendar or life cycle event	

Ritual Practices  Mitzvot Bein Adam  L'Makom	JIP.12a Names Jewish rituals and practices using appropriate terminology.	JIP.12b Summarizes basic rabbinic sources about a particular ritual practice.	JIP.12c Utilizes rabbinic text/s to explain a particular ritual practice.	JIP.12d Compares multiple opinions connected to the performance of a particular ritual practice found within rabbinic text/s.
	Examples: life cycle, holidays, brachot/tefillah			Examples: Beit Hillel and Beit Shammai lighting on Hanukkah (TB Shabbat 22b), reciting shema sitting vs. standing (Mishna Berakhot 1:3)
Connecting Holiday Themes to Practice	JIP.13a Shares a connection between a particular ritual or ritual object and a theme of a holiday.	JIP.13b Describes the connection between religious objects or rituals and the themes of a particular holiday.  Examples: Relationship of shofar to themes of Rosh Hashanah, relationship of hanukkiah to "pirsumei nisa" on Hanukkah.	JIP.13c Explains the themes of Jewish holidays as reflected in Rabbinic sources  Examples: Machloket from Masechet Sukkah about whether sukkot mentioned in the verse were ananei hakavod or sukkot mamash	JIP.13d Explores multiple themes of Jewish holidays with increasing detail, sophistication, and reference to a full range of rabbinic texts.  Examples: Rabbinic machloket about whether Achashverosh was a "melech tipesh" or a "melech rasha", proposes two different understandings of the major message of Megilat Esther.

Demonstrating Ritual Practices Mitzvot Bein Adam L'Makom	JIP.14a Participates in component parts of daily, weekly and yearly ritual practices.	JIP.14b Performs basic daily, weekly and yearly ritual practices.	JIP.14c Performs increasingly complicated ritual practices.	JIP.14d Provides accurate instruction and rationale regarding the performance of a particular ritual practice.
	Examples: Brachot (recites hamotzi before eating lunch), Kashrut (sorts foods according to what can be eaten together), Tefillah (covering eyes for Shema), Shabbat (hadlakat neirot, kiddush)	Examples: Brachot: recites appropriate brachot over food. Tefillah: When reciting the Shema, gathers tzitzit, covers eyes, whispers "baruch shem", kisses tzitzit during third paragraph. Shabbat: zemirot, havdalah	Examples: Brachot: leading the full Birkat Hamazon. Tefillah: body movement during the amidah, when and why you stand during tefillot.	Examples: Torah service: where to stand for an aliyah, how to remove the Torah from the <i>Aron</i> , returning to one's seat.
Interpersonal Vocabulary Mitzvot Bein Adam L'Chavero	JIP.15a Names Jewish interpersonal practices found in personal life using appropriate terminology.	JIP.15b Describes a selected interpersonal practice found in rabbinic texts, employing rabbinic terms and phrases.	JIP.15c Explains increasingly complicated interpersonal practices using textual support from rabbinic sources.	JIP.15d Identifies conflicts that arise between competing interpersonal practices based on rabbinic sources.
Interpersonal Practices Mitzvot Bein Adam L'Chavero	JIP.16a Summarizes the behaviors or interpersonal practices that appear in a rabbinic story.	JIP.16b Connects interpersonal practices found in the daily lives of students (individual, family or community) to those found in specific texts from Rabbinic literature.	JIP.16c Analyzes rabbinic approaches to interpersonal mitzvot.  Examples: Property rights, lost items, גר/יתום/אלמנה, גר/יתום/אלמנה, צער בעלי חיים, onat d'varim, paying workers on time, shmirat Kavod Chaver	JIP.16d Synthesizes multiple rabbinic texts to develop a description of rabbinic approaches to questions of interpersonal relationships.  Examples: rabbinic approaches to sexuality, to business ethics, workers' rights.

Rabbinic Categories Related to Practice	JIP.17a Explores the idea that "mitzvot" are Jewish commandments as opposed to "good deeds."	JIP.17b Distinguishes between practices that originate from Rabbinic texts, and those that originate in the Torah.	JIP.17c Compares and contrasts the categories of minhag and halakhah.	JIP.17d Describes the significance of the differences in the rabbinic categories of de-oraita and de-rabbanan on Jewish practice.
Rabbinic Categories Related to Practice (cont.)	JIP.17e Lists specifically Jewish practices.	JIP.17f Classifies mitzvot according to selected rabbinic categories.  Examples: aseh/lo taseh, bein adam l'makom/l'chavero	JIP.17g Analyzes a contemporary situation to determine the rabbinic categories at play.	JIP.17h Applies rabbinic categories to questions of contemporary practice.
Discovering Values Connected to Practice	JIP.18a Selects the values connected to a particular practice.	JIP.18b Infers the values embedded in a particular practice, or rabbinic text about practice.  Examples: Living in a Sukkah for seven days reflects the values of being grateful for all that you have, or the importance of collective memory, or attaching our current lived experience to that of the ancient Israelites wandering in the desert.	JIP.18c Proposes multiple values that may underlie divergent rabbinic opinions found in a text about a ritual or interpersonal practice.	JIP.18d Provides in depth analysis of the concerns and values raised in a rabbinic text about practice, based upon contemporary interpretations of that text.

<b>Divergence in Practice</b>	JIP.19a Notices different	JIP.19b Describes different	JIP.19c Describes the	JIP.19d Traces the
	practices of the same	practices of the same	evolution of a particular	development of a
	ritual.	ritual exploring the	ritual or interpersonal	particular interpersonal or
		source/s of those	practice from biblical	ritual practice through
		differences.	through rabbinic texts.	biblical, rabbinic and
	Examples: Jews from			modern texts, including
	different countries wear	Examples: Different		differences related to
	different types of kippot.	language for specific		communal norms,
		blessings for Ashkenazi		religious ideologies, and
		and Sepharadi		geography.
		communities.		

### Organizing Principle #2: Building personal connections with Jewish practices

How does performance of practices, both interpersonal and ritual, shape our understanding of ourselves? How does engaging in Jewish practices help us build a connection to Judaism? How do we develop personal responses and make meaning of Jewish practices?

Theme	K-2 Pre-Text	3-5 Beginning	6-8 Intermediate	9-12 Advanced
Developing Personal Connections to Interpersonal (Bein Adam l'Chavero) and and Ritual (Bein Adam l'Makom) Practices	JIP.20a Demonstrates an engagement with a particular Jewish practice.	JIP.20b Develops a personal connection to a specific Jewish practice drawing on rabbinic texts.	JIP.20c Draws on applications of interpersonal or ritual practices over time to generate personal significance regarding Jewish practices and rituals.	JIP.20d Formulates a compelling explanation for the performance of an interpersonal or ritual practice following a close read of interpretations related to its development over time.
Developing Communal Connections to Interpersonal and Ritual Practices	JIP.21a Makes a personal connection to a particular ritual or interpersonal practice.	JIP. 21b Explains the ways that a particular ritual or interpersonal practice helps people feel connected to Judaism and the Jewish people.	JIP. 21c Articulates the meaning of obligation (in general) and its relationship to practice and Jewish identity.  Example: Is a "Life of Jewish Practice" about abstention, about intentionality, about gratitude, etc.	JIP.21d Uses rabbinic categories, concepts, and texts to explore possible arguments for the relevance and importance of preserving individual and communal Jewish identity.

Contemporary Issues and Modern Sensibilities	JIP.22a Connects values gleaned from rabbinic practices to current life experience.	JIP.22b Applies values gleaned from rabbinic texts to contemporary situations.	JIP.22c Analyzes rabbinic texts on topics that are personally relevant, and connects that analysis to the development of personal practice.	JIP.22d Employs understandings from multiple sources within rabbinic literature when forming opinions about current world realities.
	Examples: Tza'ar Ba'alei  hayyim means that we need to feed class fish every day, and not forget about them.	Examples: The obligation to not oppress the stranger requires interpersoanl treatment of refugees today.	Examples: Gender norms; concepts of peoplehood; taking care of one's body, modesty, etc.	Example: Compares Rambam Hilkhot Matanot L'Aninyim; selected sugyot from Bava Batra; Mefarshim on Devarim 15, contemporary thinkers such as Jonathan Saks (to Heal a Fractured World: Charity as Justice) and Jill Jacobs to suggest a modern approach to lack of affordable housing.
Grappling with Challenges to Ritual Practices Mitzvot Bein Adam L'Makom	JIP.23a Shares what is difficult about a ritual practice.	JIP.23b Describes obstacles to the performance of ritual mitzvot.	JIP.23c Identifies ritual practices that conflict with modern sensibilities comparing the context that gave rise to the ritual and the contemporary context.	JIP.23d Explores multiple contemporary understandings of a ritual practice that can be viewed as "irrelevant" or "outdated" to develop an understanding of that ritual.

Grappling with Challenges to Interpersonal Practices Mitzvot Bein Adam L'Chavero	JIP.24a Reports on moments when it was difficult to do the "right" thing.	JIP.24b Describes obstacles to the performance of interpersonal mitzvot.	JIP.24c Identifies discrepancies between the values in a rabbinic text about practice and those in their own lives, and negotiates those differences.	JIP.24d Exhibits the disposition to hear the text speak from its particular context when reading sources that can be viewed as "irrelevant" or "outdated".
Exploring Diversity of Practice	JIP.25a Demonstrates an awareness of the variety of practices that are present in the Jewish tradition.	JIP.25b Recognizes that different practices reflect multiple legitimate ways to practice Judaism.	JIP.25c Defends and critiques the ideas and values contained within a particular mahloket or differences in ritual or interpersonal practice.	JIP.25d Compares differences of practice between different geographic communities, time periods, or movements, describing the factors that gave rise
	Example: different customs around hamotzi; pouring salt versus dipping in salt, cutting versus tearing, hand out pieces of bread versus letting everyone take their own.	Example: Dialogues respectfully about Jewish practices and values that are both similar to and different from their own personal practices and values.	Examples: Different language for specific blessings for Ashkenazi and Sephardi communities.	to these differences.

## Organizing Principle #3: Expressing Jewish identity through practice

How do we enact interpersonal and ritual practices in our lives?

What criteria do we use to make decisions about which Jewish practices we choose to take on?

Theme	K-2	3-5	6-8	9-12
	Pre-Text	Beginning	Intermediate	Advanced
Enacting Ritual Practices Mitzvot Bein Adam L'Makom	JIP.30a Initiates personal participation in Jewish ritual practices, both in school and at home.	JIP.30b Explains the steps involved in the fulfillment of a particular ritual practice citing rabbinic texts for support.	JIP.30c Demonstrates competence and confidence in the performance of frequently performed ritual practices.	JIP.30d Demonstrates competence and confidence in increasingly complicated and sporadically performed ritual practices.
	<b>Examples:</b> reciting shema at bedtime, berakhot before eating		Examples: Leads birkat hamazon, recites Friday night kiddush, leads community in tefillah	Examples: Leads tefillah on a fast day, blows shofar.

Enacting Interpersonal Practices Mitzvot Bein Adam L'Chavero	JIP.31a Connects interpersonal mitzvot into personal ethical decisions.  Examples: I'm not going to say something mean about a classmate since I shouldn't speak leshon hara; I'm going to call my friend who missed school today because we are supposed to visit the sick; We should make a class lost and found so that we return lost objects	JIP.31b Identifies interpersonal mitzvot that guide personal practice and decision making.  Examples: bal tash-hit as reason behind practices of reduce, reuse, recycle; Applying rabbinic steps of teshuvah rather than simply saying "I'm sorry"; using rabbinic understandings of the priority of giving tzedakah when making decisions of who to give money	JIP.31c Applies relevant dilemmas and conflicts that arise in Rabbinic texts to clarify and make decisions when faced with a personal dilemma.	JIP.31d Employs Jewish ethical categories in developing a personal approach to ethical living based on in-depth analysis of multiple rabbinic texts regarding interpersonal relationships.  Examples: hesed, tzedakah, tikkun olam, kavod ha'briyot, balancing and prioritizing competing principles (selecting organizations to support based on their connection to ethical concepts found in rabbinic literature)
Valuing Jewish Practice	JIP.32a Initiates or joins in activities connected to a Jewish ritual or interpersonal practice.	JIP.32b Integrates a particular Jewish ritual or interpersonal practice into daily routine.	JIP.32c Plans for the integration of Jewish ritual and interpersonal practices in daily routines and decision making.	JIP.32d Influences others to integrate a Jewish practice or interpersonal principle into daily routines.
Employing Authorities or Resources in Decision Making about Practice	JIP.33a Identifies guides, models and authorities to turn to for help to guide one's Jewish practice.  Examples: Jewish Texts, Teachers, Parents, Rabbis	JIP.33b Explains the role of guides, models, and authorities to turn to help guide one's Jewish practice.	JIP.33c Examines proffered guides, models, authorities, and accepts or rejects them, explaining their reasoning.	JIP.33d Develops a nuanced approach to receiving outside guidance on making decisions regarding Jewish practice.

Develops an Approach to Ritual and Interpersonal Practices to Promote Jewish Identity	JIP.34a Explores different modes of a ritual or interpersonal practice in the classroom.	JIP.34b Contributes to the fulfillment of ritual or interpersonal practices at home.	JIP.34c Explains decisions about a ritual or interpersonal practice based on textual evidence for support of that practice.	JIP.34d Develops a personal approach to a particular ritual or interpersonal practice, based on an analysis of rabbinic texts.
		<b>Examples:</b> Contributes to preparation of Shabbat dinner at home, creates a family tzedakah ritual	Examples: Why a community or individual modified, adopted or rejected a specific ritual practice	Examples: tefillah, haggim, Shabbat, kashrut, Ttzedakah, shomer, rodeph shalom
Applying Ritual and Interpersonal Practices in New or Original Ways	JIP.35a Creates a personal ritual object informed by models developed using rabbinic guidelines.	JIP.35b Expands on an existing ritual or interpersonal practice based on a rabbinic debate regarding that practice.	JIP.35c Adapts a ritual or interpersonal practice to reflect the values behind the particular practice.	JIP.35d Creates new rituals and practices for contemporary situations or life cycle events that are grounded in models found in rabbinic literature.

William Davidson Graduate School of Jewish Education

## Legacy Heritage Instructional Leadership Institute



## **Pursuing Justice and Loving Kindness**

Students will engage with rabbinic texts as a way to inform, inspire and deepen their commitment to acts of *tzedek* (justice) and *hesed* (compassion).

Through a focused engagement with rabbinic texts that both speak to and challenge our modern sensibilities, students will develop a personal and communal understanding of our obligation as human beings created in the image of God to build a world filled with acts of *tzedek* and *hesed*. Rabbi Abraham Joshua Heschel teaches that "religion begins with a consciousness that something is asked of us." This standard embodies this principle, nurturing a sense of responsibility toward the world and an obligation to act. This call to action or service can be found throughout rabbinic literature and has nurtured Jewish life throughout the generations.

Shining a spotlight on the timeless rabbinic principles of *gemilut* hasadim - "acts of loving-kindness" (helping others in their moment of need) - and "tzedek, tzedek tirdof" - "justice, justice, you shall pursue" (addressing systemic or structural inequalities in our world), students will learn that the rabbis developed a rich set of laws and practices that channel a desire to realize these principles. Students will utilize both the positive and negative models in rabbinic literature to internalize this Jewish obligation to act, to develop feelings of empathy and compassion, to confront ideas of right and just, and to build an awareness that individual actions make a difference. Following after the teachings of Rabbi Sarra Lev, this standard challenges students to learn to read rabbinic literature with attentiveness to its moral complexity and through this process summon us to create a more compassionate and just society.

DRAFT DOCUMENT NOT FOR DISTRIBUTION

### **Pursuing Justice and Loving Kindness**

**Standard:** Through the study of rabbinic literature, students will cultivate a commitment to the Jewish obligation to act with *tzedek* (justice) and *hesed* (compassion).

### **Preamble:**

Through a focused engagement with rabbinic texts that both speak to and challenge our modern sensibilities, students will develop a personal and communal understanding of our obligation as human beings created in the image of God to build a world filled with acts of *tzedek* and <u>hesed</u>. Rabbi Abraham Joshua Heschel teaches that "religion begins with a consciousness that something is asked of us." This standard embodies this principle, nurturing a sense of responsibility toward the world and an obligation to act. This call to action or service can be found throughout rabbinic literature and has nurtured Jewish life throughout the generations.

Shining a spotlight on the timeless rabbinic principles of *gemilut* <u>hasadim</u> - "acts of loving-kindness" (helping others in their moment of need) - and "tzedek, tzedek tirdof" - "justice, justice, you shall pursue" (addressing systemic or structural inequalities in our world), students will learn that the rabbis developed a rich set of laws and practices that channel a desire to realize these principles. Students will utilize both the positive and negative models in rabbinic literature to internalize this Jewish obligation to act, to develop feelings of empathy and compassion, to confront ideas of right and just, and to build an awareness that individual actions make a difference. Following after the teachings of Rabbi Sarra Lev, this standard challenges students to learn to read rabbinic literature with attentiveness to its moral complexity and through this process summon us to create a more compassionate and just society.

### **Organizing Principles:**

(IMPORTANT NOTE about the Organizing Principles in this standard. Because of the nature of teaching and learning texts for personal and world transformation, studying rabbinic literature through the lens of this standard requires an inherently non-linear process. When studying through this lens, the self encounters texts, which inform the self, which inspire action, which brings us back to a dialogue with texts, etc. Any unit of instruction based in this standard should include benchmarks from all three Organizing Principles. Each of the Organizing Principles must be intertwined and cannot stand alone.)

- 1. TEXT Limmud Torah/ Hokhmah: Examining rabbinic texts on justice and compassion. What are the rabbinic roots of pursuing justice and compassion? How does rabbinic literature define and differentiate between the two values of justice and compassion?
  - Students will engage in close readings of rabbinic texts to uncover the concepts that underlie the Jewish obligation to act and bring justice and compassion into the world. They will explore the values of <u>hesed</u> and <u>tzedek</u> found in rabbinic texts in order to develop a deep understanding of rabbinic conceptions of a compassionate and just society.
- 2. SELF Binah: Developing the motivation to act. How can rabbinic literature summon us to be our best selves? How can becoming our best selves help us to act with hesed and tzedek?
  - Through a close reading of rabbinic texts, students will cultivate the character traits and dispositions necessary to act with compassion and justice. They will discover what motivates them to act. Developing their own understandings of <u>hesed</u> and tzedek in today's world, students will explore how to become their best selves and act with <u>hesed</u> and <u>tzedek</u>.
- 3. ACTION Ma'aseh: Answering the call to act. Where and when do I need to act? How can rabbinic literature help me to be a better advocate for hesed and tzedek?
  - Students will learn to answer the call to act with kindness and to work for social change that brings <u>h</u>esed and tzedek into our world.

### **Benchmarks**

Organizing Principle #1: Text - *Limmud Torah*/ *Hokhmah*: Examining rabbinic texts on justice and compassion What are the rabbinic roots of pursuing justice and compassion?

How does rabbinic literature define and differentiate between the two values of justice and compassion?

		-		
Theme	K-2	3-5	6-8	9-12
	Pre-Text	Beginning	Intermediate	Advanced
Textual Connections Between Mitzvah and Responsibility	PJLK.10a Connects the term "mitzvah" to responsibility and obligation (and not as a "good deed").	PJLK.10b Extrapolates specific responsibilities from particular mitzvot or texts.	PJLK.10c Explores rabbinic texts for messages about differing responsibilities.  Examples: to home and outside communities; to individuals and society at large, "circles of obligation"	PJLK.10d Compares rabbinic texts with contrasting views about obligation and responsibility to others and to society.
Understanding Tzedek	PJLK.11a Points out acts of tzedek in rabbinic stories.  Examples: issues of fairness & equity; lost objects; division of resources	PJLK.11b Identifies and explains key vocabulary associated with tzedek in rabbinic texts.  Examples: i.e. clarify that tzedek does not equal giving of tzedakah, but that giving of money to charity might, in some cases, help bring tzedek into the world	PJLK.11c Compares the concept of tzedek within the TaNaKH to its references in rabbinic texts.	PJLK.11d Analyzes the development of the concept of tzedek in rabbinic texts, to its understanding in responsa literature and contemporary Jewish writing.

Understanding <u>H</u> esed	PJLK.12a Points out acts of hesed in rabbinic stories.  Examples: hakhnasat orchim, bikkur holim, etc.	PJLK.12b Explains key vocabulary associated with <u>hesed</u> in rabbinic texts.	PJLK.12c Compares the concept of <u>h</u> esed within the TaNaKH to its references in rabbinic texts.	PJLK.12d Analyzes the development of the concept of <u>hesed</u> in rabbinic texts, to its understanding in responsa literature and contemporary Jewish writing.
Disagreements Within or With Texts About <u>H</u> esed/Tzedek	PJLK.13a Describes different ways that people act with <u>hesed</u> or tzedek in rabbinic stories.	PJLK.13b Identifies multiple or competing perspectives on an issue related to <u>hesed</u> or tzedek within a single text.	rabbinic perspectives, including those that raise challenging issues, from multiple texts on a given issue related to <u>hesed</u> or tzedek.  Examples: responsibility for the those without power, how to treat the poor; how much tzedakah to give	PJLK.13d Grapples with challenging texts which offer perspectives that are different from today's viewpoint.  Examples: keeping slaves, negative attitudes towards the deaf or mentally impaired; who can be a witness; status of women
Motivation for Acting or not Acting with Hesed/Tzedek Gleaned from Text	PJLK.14a Offers an explanation for why a character acted with <u>h</u> esed or tzedek.	PJLK.14b Offers multiple explanations for why a key figure within a rabbinic text acted (or did not act) with <u>h</u> esed or tzedek.	PJLK.14c Offers multiple readings of a text to develop a nuanced understanding of its potential messages, as opposed to a simplistic moral message.	PJLK.14d Practices "reading with generosity" in inferring possible assumptions behind rabbinics texts advocating for a particular behavior in a situation or particular context.

Theological/Kedushah Connections to <u>H</u> esed and Tzedek	PJLK.15a Retells stories where the rabbis describe God as a role model for acting with <u>h</u> esed or tzedek in midrash.	PJLK.15b Analyzes texts that describe God as a role model for acting with <u>h</u> esed or tzedek in midrash.	PJLK.15c Analyzes legal texts that connect acts of <u>hesed</u> or tzedek with ideas about God.	PJLK.15d Analyzes rabbinic perspectives on the sacredness of acting with <u>hesed</u> or tzedek.
		Examples: Ma hu af atah; rabbinic understanding of God's visit at beginning of Vayera as the source of bikkur holim		

Organizing Principle #2: Self - *Binah*: Developing the motivation to act.

How can rabbinic literature summon us to be our best selves?

How can becoming our best selves help us to act with hesed and tzedek?

Theme	K-2	3-5	6-8	9-12
	Pre-Text	Beginning	Intermediate	Advanced
Character Dispositions	PJLK.20a Describes qualities modeled by figures in rabbinic literature who are pursuing <u>hesed</u> and tzedek.  Examples: listening,	PJLK.20b Explains dispositions that motivate people to bring <u>hesed</u> and tzedek into the world with examples from rabbinic texts.	PJLK.20c Identifies from multiple text sources the personal dispositions the rabbis tried to foster in order to develop the desire to act on behalf of others and the world.	PJLK.20d Describes dispositions that need to be balanced in order to fulfill a particular obligation of <u>h</u> esed and tzedek.
	compromising, sharing	Examples: seeing tzelem Elohim in others and self	Examples: "You were slaves in Egypt"; "You were strangers in a strange land"	Examples: anava and gevura; din and rahamim
Applying Personal Character Dispositions	PJLK.21a Participates in a classroom environment that models character dispositions related to acting with <u>hesed</u> and tzedek.  Examples: treating others with kindness, taking turns, expressing gratitude	PJLK.21b Incorporates actss of <u>hesed</u> and tzedek into daily life.	PJLK.21c Identifies moments in personal life when dispositions of <u>hesed</u> and tzedek were, or could have been, applied.  Examples: empathy, persistence, values of community and inclusion during middle school years	PJLK.21d Identifies real life situations when it was challenging to apply dispositions of <u>hesed</u> and tzedek.

	T			
Appreciating a Variety of Approaches to Engaging in <u>H</u> esed/Tzedek	PJLK.22a Identifies different ways to do <u>h</u> esed and tzedek.	of paths to pursuing <u>hesed</u> and <u>tzedek</u> .  Examples: giving close to home and giving across the world; giving time; giving money	pJLK.22c Evaluates different approaches to pursuing a particular act of hesed or tzedek.  Examples: Rambam's rankings	pJLK.22d Evaluates potential conflicting values related to pursuing a particular act of <u>hesed</u> or tzedek. Examples: balancing human dignity and efficacy
Motivations for Engaging in Acts of <u>H</u> esed/Tzedek	PJLK.23a Demonstrates pride when acting with hesed or tzedek.	PJLK.23b Articulates personal reasons for engaging in a particular act of <u>h</u> esed or tzedek encountered in a rabbinic text.	PJLK.23c Evaluates multiple motivations leading a person to engage in a particular act of hesed or tzedek.  Examples: school or bar mitzvah community service requirement: why have external requirement for something ideally internally motivated?	PJLK.23d Analyzes the relative role of religious obligation ( <u>hiyyuv</u> ) in personal or others' decision to pursue a particular act of <u>hesed</u> or tzedek.
Challenges to Engaging in Acts of Hesed/Tzedek	PJLK.24a Shares times that it is difficult to pursue hesed or tzedek.	PJLK.24b Reflects on a particular situation when it was personally difficult to pursue an act of <u>h</u> esed or tzedek found in a rabbinic text.	PJLK.24c Identifies and explains the difficulties that others might have in pursuing hesed or tzedek in a particular situation.  Examples: expresses understanding of those difficulties	PJLK.24d Develops and shares personal insights gained from analyzing obstacles or consequences to pursuing <u>hesed</u> or tzedek.  Examples: if I live only with generosity to the outside world, what impact could there be to my family?; do I have a personal leaning towards either <u>hesed</u> or tzedek, and why?

Connecting <u>H</u> esed/Tzedek to  Contemporary Issues	PJLK.25a Describes the ways that our actions bring <u>hesed</u> and tzedek to the classroom.	PJLK.25b Describes the ways that personal acts can bring <u>h</u> esed and tzedek to individuals and to society.	PJLK.25c Analyzes rabbinic texts relevant to emergent or contemporary issues.	PJLK.25d Develops a personal position on a social issue, based on a range of rabbinic perspectives.
	Examples: sharing use of classroom supplies or toys	Examples: "When I give away my toys, I help others have something they might have lacked"	Examples: refugees, hunger, homelessness	

# Organizing Principle #3: Action - Ma'aseh: Answering the call to act Where and when do I need to act?

How can rabbinic literature help me to be a better advocate for hesed and tzedek?

Theme	K-2	3-5	6-8	9-12
	Pre-Text	Beginning	Intermediate	Advanced
Rabbinic Vocabulary and Concepts Related to Ma'aseh	PJLK.30a Matches names or concepts to particular acts of <u>h</u> esed or tzedek.  Examples: malbish arumim for the value that leads us	PJLK.30b Identifies service acts that can enact a particular named value or concept related to <u>h</u> esed or tzedek.  Examples: to do bikkur cholim, I can make a card	PJLK.30c Explains the importance of a particular act of <u>hesed</u> or tzedek based on personal experience and rabbinic texts.	PJLK.30d Explores the relationship between obligation/responsibility and choice in the pursuit of <u>h</u> esed and tzedek.
Identifying Needs	to run a coat drive  PJLK.31a Uses rabbinic stories about people in need of kindness and justice when noticing the needs of others.	for a friend who is sick.  PJLK.31b Develops categories of people in need of <u>h</u> esed or tzedek based on reading of rabbinic texts.	PJLK.31c Utilizes multiple rabbinic texts to establish categories of individual or communal needs.	PJLK.31d Explores the interconnectedness of multiple needs between person, family and/or community based on an analysis of multiple rabbinic texts.
Ongoing Considerations		PJLK.32a Identifies specific (doable) ways that they are able to act to make a difference in a social/world issue based on a rabbinic obligation of pursuing acts of <a href="https://examples.writing.collecting">hesed</a> or tzedek.  Examples: writing to representative, collecting items for donation, etc.	PJLK.32b Keeps the rabbbinic concepts of human dignity at the forefront of planning <u>h</u> esed or tzedek activities.	PJLK.32c Draws on rabbinic texts to manage and respond to the finite nature of personal, financial and time resources.

Planning and Implementing <u>H</u> esed/Tzedek	PJLK.33a Suggests and performs (with adult assistance) acts of <u>hesed</u> or tzedek in response to situations in stories or real life.  Examples: treating others with kindness, making sandwiches for food bank; decorating cards for a hospital	PJLK.33b Initiates acts of hesed or tzedek within classroom or school community.	PJLK.33c Participates with other organizations in <u>h</u> esed or tzedek activities.	PJLK.33d Organizes others in working on a <u>h</u> esed or tzedek project.
Planning and Implementing <u>H</u> esed/Tzedek (cont.)	PJLK.34a Describes what was hard when pursuing a particular act of <u>h</u> esed or tzedek.	PJLK.34b Identifies the challenges in pursuing rabbinic obligations of <u>hesed</u> or tzedek during a particular social action project.	PJLK.34c Establishes personal criteria for selecting a project based on considerations gleaned from rabbinic texts.  Examples: needs, impact, rabbinic values, practicality, personality, etc.	PJLK.34d Develops a social action project rooted in rabbinic concepts and texts.
Post-Action Reflection	PJLK.35a Identifies what has improved after the performance of an act of <u>hesed</u> or tzedek.	PJLK.35b Describes the feelings/experiences after performing an act of <u>h</u> esed or tzedek.	PJLK.35c Evaluates challenges and successes of a particular act of <u>h</u> esed or tzedek.	PJLK.35d Prioritizes opportunities in personal schedule for acts of <u>h</u> esed or tzedek.

### **Appendix A - Service Learning Benchmarks:**

- (SL = Service Learning which was the Original Standard Title; the following benchmarks are connected to the skills and knowledge students need to effectively participate in and lead service/social action projects, but do not directly emerge from the study of rabbinic literature.)
- SL.20 Evaluates areas of need in order to choose a school or local service learning project to implement.
- SL.70 Evaluates potential impact of assistance on a group or individual in need in order to select a service learning project to implement.
- SL.83 Researches local Jewish/general service organizations and selects a partner agency to serve an identified need.
- SL.238 Creates and implements a plan to address a contemporary or emergent crisis.
- SL.145 Evaluates different organizations and their effectiveness against the standards articulated within rabbinic texts.
- SL.36 Effectively explains the potential impact of our assistance on a group or individual in need. (communication skills)
- SL.80 Identifies needs for specific Jewish skills that they can provide.

**Examples:** Megillah reading for Jewish seniors, Hebrew singing for apartment residents

- SL.81 Acquires particular Jewish ritual skills in order to fulfill a specific need.
- SL.23 Develops a detailed plan for a school or local group *hesed* project directed at a specific identified need.
- SL.85 Plans a campaign to address an issue through advocacy, raising awareness, fundraising, or field scan of several organizations engaging on one particular issue.
- SL.146 Implements an individual *hesed* project (possibly tied into Bar/Bat Mitzvah project).
- SL.141 Develops a list of strategies for fundraising to support a community service project.
- SL.45 Identifies a lesson-learned about self or others based on service experience.
- SL.140 Delegates responsibility when organizing a community service project.

- SL.93 Reflects on and assesses the effects of the <u>h</u>esed project on yourself and others by identifying the successes and challenges of the project in order to improve subsequent projects.
- SL.47 Applies the identified successes and challenges of a project in order to improve on subsequent projects.
- SL.163 Assesses the impact of a <u>h</u>esed project on themselves and others in order to identify not only the successes and challenges of the project, but why it matters, and how it has changed their perspective.
- SL.261 Analyzes and reflects upon the relationship between texts studied and service performed.

William Davidson Graduate School of Jewish Education

## Legacy Heritage Instructional Leadership Institute



## **Rabbinic Value Commitments**

Students will discern the values expressed in rabbinic texts and will develop the capacity to engage those values in meaningful dialogue.

Rabbinic texts are often implicit expressions or enactments of the ideals and value commitments of the rabbis. For example, divergent value commitments are often the implicit basis for the debates (*machlokot*) recorded throughout the Talmud. This standard offers students the opportunity to learn to discern the implicit values at play, as the rabbis made decisions regarding the creation of a Jewish society for their day and the future.

On the explicit level, the student of rabbinic texts encounters the rabbis' rich ethical vocabulary, terms like "pikuah nefesh" or "mipnei darkei shalom" that not only name a value but that point to a complex tradition of ethical deliberation. Through a deep encounter with rabbinic texts, the careful reader will explore a range of terms used to describe rabbinic value commitments. These ideals reflect rabbinic worldviews and are at the foundation of Jewish ethics, often underlying the rules and decisions regarding particular practices.

In addition, this standard offers students the opportunity to cultivate the dispositions necessary to engage in an honest dialogue with rabbinic values. They will develop the internal capacity to listen for and consider the values behind the texts and rulings even when an initial reading pushes against contemporary values.

The successful acquisition of this ethical vocabulary serves as a powerful resource for ethical living today. The terms and concepts developed by the rabbis are tools that students can use to inform their own thinking as they move through the world and confront the ethical choices they make as individuals and as part of a community. By acquiring a strong understanding of values as they appear in rabbinic texts, students will be able to clearly, carefully and sensitively navigate the complicated issues of today.

DRAFT DOCUMENT NOT FOR DISTRIBUTION

### **Rabbinic Value Commitments**

**Standard:** Students will discern the values expressed in rabbinic texts and will develop the capacity to engage those values in meaningful dialogue.

### **Preamble:**

Rabbinic texts are often implicit expressions or enactments of the ideals and value commitments of the rabbis. For example, divergent value commitments are often the implicit basis for the debates (*machlokot*) recorded throughout the Talmud. This standard offers students the opportunity to learn to discern the implicit values at play, as the rabbis made decisions regarding the creation of a Jewish society for their day and the future.

On the explicit level, the student of rabbinic texts encounters the rabbis' rich ethical vocabulary, terms like "pikuach nefesh" or "mipnei darkei shalom" that not only name a value but that point to a complex tradition of ethical deliberation. Through a deep encounter with rabbinic texts, the careful reader will explore the rich ethical vocabulary of the rabbis and discover a range of terms for rabbinic value commitments. These ideals reflect rabbinic worldviews and are at the foundation of Jewish ethics, often underlying the rules and decisions regarding particular practices.

In addition, this standard offers students the opportunity to cultivate the dispositions necessary to engage in an honest dialogue with rabbinic values. They will develop the internal capacity to listen for and consider the values behind the texts and rulings even when an initial reading pushes against contemporary values.

The successful acquisition of this ethical vocabulary serves as a powerful resource for ethical living today. The terms and concepts developed by the rabbis are tools that students can use to inform their own thinking as they move through the world and confront the ethical choices they make as individuals and as part of a community. By acquiring a strong understanding of values as they appear in rabbinic texts, students will be able to clearly, carefully and sensitively navigate the complicated issues of today.

### **Organizing Principles:**

- 1. Developing an ethical vocabulary: What are the categories, words and terms that are integral to the rabbis' thinking and decision-making and that express their commitments?
  - Students will acquire a nuanced understanding of the terms and concepts that inform the values of our sages and engage with those concepts at increasing levels of sophistication.
- 2. Reading rabbinic texts for implied value commitments: What is this text really about? What ideals and value commitments drive particular positions?
  - Students will develop the skills to read texts and uncover the rabbis' unstated values. This includes working to infer the motivations behind the various positions held within a *mahloket*, or the motivations behind particular statements in a rabbinic discussion. Students will develop the capacity to infer the value commitments behind rabbinic statements.
- 3. Engaging in dialogue with rabbinic value commitments: How do I make the foreign familiar? Why would somebody say this? How might time and place have influenced the decisions and opinions found in rabbinic texts?

  To truly engage rabbinic value commitments in meaningful dialogue, students will develop an understanding of the rabbis' world in order to build a mature and nuanced understanding of the statements, rulings and actions of the rabbis. An important goal here is for students to develop the ability to encounter and seriously engage with challenging texts that seem to conflict (or actually do conflict) with contemporary values.
- 4. Applying rabbinic value commitments to new situations: How might rabbinic texts contribute to contemporary conversations around values? What would it look like for me to take a particular text, value, or idea seriously? Students will explore the implications for practice behind the rabbis' understandings of ethical choices and dilemmas and will bring that understanding to bear on contemporary situations.

### **Benchmarks**

Organizing Principle #1: Developing an ethical vocabulary What are the categories, words and terms used to express rabbinic value commitments? Theme K-2 3-5 6-8 9-12 Pre-Text **Beginning** Advanced Intermediate **Values Vocabulary RVC.10a** Retells aggadot **RVC.10b** Summarizes **RVC.10c** Summarizes **RVC.10d** Traces core rabbinic value language or and halakhot associated rabbinic texts that include increasingly complicated (exploring "core" a particular rabbinic value texts related to core with a particular value. multiple core values. rabbinic value - those values. concept through rabbinic that occupy a central literature. place in the rabbinic **Examples:** Shmirat HaGuf value system) and the category of **Examples:** Giving **Examples:** Pikuah nefesh Examples: tzedakah, mitzvot bein adam anonymously (Shabbat and its diverse application kiddush Hashem, tokheha, l'atzmo: Story about Hillel 10b) including its limits mipnei tikkun olam, yehareq v'al ya'avor (BT bathing (Vayikra Rabbah mipnei darkei shalom Pesachim 25a) 34:3) **RVC.11b** Discusses an **RVC.11d** Compares and **Explicit Value RVC.11a** Names the values **RVC.11c** Explains rabbinic understandings of a contrasts diverse found in a rabbinic story. explicit rabbinic value Commitments found in the text citing particular value drawing understandings of a textual evidence. from an exploration of specific value across multiple texts. multiple texts. **Examples:** Responsibility **Examples:** Controlling **Examples:** Hillel and the **Examples:** bikur holim, prospective convert ahavat Yisrael. shmirat to self, others, God, anger: BT Yevamot 96b "What is hateful to you.." ha'lashon, tza'ar ba'alei returning) השבת אבידה (anger leads to idolatry) (BT Shabbat 31a); lost property) שמירת שבת and Shabbat 105b (anger hayyim, etc. to instill fear in one's (observance of Shabbat), הכנסת אורחים Avraham and the 3 guests household) etc. (BT Bava Metzia 87a)

Explicit Value Commitments in Halakhic (legal) Texts		RVC.12a Explains Jewish laws in terms of their values where explicitly stated in a rabbinic text. (ta'amei hamitzvot)	RVC.12b Analyzes a particular halakhic decision (or indecision) based on the explicit discussion of the particular value/s at play.	RVC.12c Compares multiple opinions or texts that offer different approaches to an explicit value in a halakhic debate.
		Text Examples: Dwelling in a sukkah reminds us of our experience in the desert - dwelling in huts or the "clouds of glory" (BT Sukkah 11b)	Text Examples: "A person should not give away more than % of his earnings to tzedakah as he has an obligation to support himself. (BT Ketubot 50a)	Text Examples: R' Yohanan lamenting loss of Reish Lakish (TB Bava Metzi'a 84a), Beit Hillel listening to words of Beit Shammai and changing views (M Eduyot 1:12)
Explicit Value Conflicts or Dilemmas	RVC.13a Describes difficult value choices found in a rabbinic story.	RVC.13b Identifies and explains the explicit value choices in a rabbinic text.	RVC.13c Describes situations where the strength/authority of one particular value is limited on the basis of a competing value.	RVC.13d Describes increasingly complex situations where the strength/authority of one particular value is limited on the basis of a competing value.
	Text Examples: Hillel v. Shammai and the potential convert. (BT Shabbat 31a)	Text Examples: Seeing a Rabbi doing something you perceive as immoral - Should you judge? (BT Berakhot 19a), Truthfulness in keitsad merakdim lifnei hakallah (BT Ketubot 16a/17b)	Text Examples:  ארר ארץ תורה/דרך ארץ or תלמוד תורה/דרך ארץ or not speaking too highly of one's hosts so people don't take advantage of them (BT Bava Metzi'a 24a), What does בבוד override?  D'rabanan/D'Oraita- (BT Berakhot 19b)	Text Examples: Prohibition of wounding a parent v. performing a medical procedure on him/her. (BT Sanhedrin 84b); and how the Rabbis nullified I Samuel 15:3 killing all Amalekites (M. Yadayim 4:4)

Hierarchy of Value	RVC.14a Identifies the	RVC.14b Explains the	RVC.14c Applies the
Commitments	hierarchy of values within	hierarchy of a particular	underlying principles of a
	a given text.	value through analysis of	particular hierarchy of
		different voices within an	values found in a rabbinic
		individual text or across	text to a contemporary
		multiple texts.	situation.
	Text Examples: R' Yehuda	Text Examples: Limits on	Text Examples:
	fails to protect a calf	self-defense (BT Sanhedrin	Implications of "Do not
	because 'For this you were	74a, BT Pesa <u>h</u> im 25b and	stand idly by the blood of
	created'. R' Yehuda is	BT Yoma 82b)	your fellow" (BT Sanhedrin
	severely punished for this.		73a)
	(BT Bava Metzia 8a)		

#### Organizing Principle #2: Reading rabbinic texts for implied value commitments What is this text *really* about? What value commitment/s drive a particular position? Theme K-2 3-5 6-8 9-12 **Beginning** Pre-Text Intermediate Advanced **RVC.20b** Infers the implied **Implicit Value** RVC.20d Uses textual **RVC.20a** Suggests an **RVC.20c** Proposes implied value contained value(s) contained within evidence from multiple multiple potential values Commitments within a rabbinic story. a rabbinic text citing behind a mitzvah or sources or multiple sides textual evidence for of an argument to develop halakhic position citing support. a values-based textual evidence for explanation of a particular support. mitzvah or halakhah. **Text Examples: Text Examples:** Death of Inform the recipient of a R' Akiva's students and gift who the giver is continuation of Torah implied value may be learning - possible values letting people know they are respect for one Text Example: "A person are cared for (BT Shabbat another and the should not eat meat 10b) importance of Torah study unless he has a particular (BT Yevamot 72b) craving for it" (BT Hulin 84a) or "Good Samaritan" law (BT Sanhedrin 74a), קב שלו (BT Bava Metzi'a 38a) **Rabbinic Disputes RVC.21a** Fxamines **RVC.21b** Extracts the **RVC.21c** Explains the **RVC.21d** Predicts the multiple basic rabbinic connection(s) between implicit source(s) of implications of the (Mahlokot) as texts to identify a values and positions tension within a multiple opinions within **Potential Expressions** around a particular a rabbinic debate. shared value. rabbinic debate. of Conflicting Value ritual or ethical practice.

Commitments

Rabbinic Disputes (Mahlokot) as Potential Expressions of Conflicting Value Commitments (cont.)	RVC.21e Explains that a mahloket is an argument about what is most important in a given situation.	RVC.21f Describes the competing value(s) and idea(s) behind conflicting positions in a rabbinic disagreement.  Text Examples: Where to insert the havdalah in Amidah? Is havdalah mainly an act of distinguishing or an act of acknowledging? (BT Berakhot 33b)	RVC.21g Suggests the implicit Jewish value statement/s behind conflicting positions in a rabbinic debate.  Text Examples: R' Yishmael's limitations of יהרג ואל יעבר when it comes to ז"ע (Sanhedrin 74a)	RVC.21h Posits the motives and mindsets of the rabbis involved in a mahloket and justifies their positions with textual evidence.  Text Examples: R' Yohanan ben Zakkai who on his deathbed isn't sure he made the right choice about Yavneh, deliberations in tanuro shel achnai on how to break the news to Rabbi Eliezer
Ritual Practices (e.g., holidays, tefillah, etc.) as Potential Expressions of Value Commitments	RVC.22a Explains the value/s behind a ritual practice connected to holiday observance.	RVC.22b Suggests a value behind a holiday or ritual practice as seen through the conflicting positions within a rabbinic debate.	RVC.22c Describes the conflicting values at play in texts related to a particular ritual practice.	RVC.22d Examines arguments found in holiday related texts, and infers what value(s) motivated the Halakha to follow a particular opinion.
	Text Examples: Sukkot - joy, fragility, wandering, arba minim and achdut midrashim	Text Examples: ס בית הלל .v בית שמאי on נרות חנוכה חרוסת בפסח - מצוה או לא? (פסחים פרק י: ג')	Text Examples: חכמים v. ר' יהודה on עיצומו של יום מכפר outlawing the practice of "sharing" lulavim in Jerusalem on the hag (BT Sukkah)	Text Examples: Who leans at the seder? (BT Pesahim 108a)

Organizing Principle #3: Engaging in dialogue with rabbinic value commitments
How do I make the foreign familiar?
Why would somebody say this?

Why would somebody say this?				
Theme	K-2	3-5	6-8	9-12
	Pre-Text	Beginning	Intermediate	Advanced
Making the Foreign Familiar	RVC.30a Points to similarities and differences between descriptions of life in a rabbinic text and contemporary life.	RVC.30b Describes the various prominent cultural trends during the Rabbinic time period.	RVC.30c Analyzes the effect of historical and cultural context on the values behind a particular rabbinic statement or position.	RVC.30d Suggests the potential cultural influence(s) on the development of a particular rabbinic value.
		Text Examples: destruction of 2nd temple period. Early Amoraic period (Bavel as center for Torah study - Sura, Pumpedita)	Text Examples: Kamsa/Bar Kamsa (BT Gittin 55b), the law of the land is the law (BT Bava Kamma 113a)	Text Examples: compare the attitude of R' Shimon (very negative) to the Romans with that of R'Yehuda (respectful) and consider the context of Roman attitudes toward Jews during their respective periods. (Hadrian vs. Antoninus)
Conflicts with Contemporary Values		RVC.31a Formulates questions around rabbinic statements or texts that challenge broadly held contemporary values.	RVC.31b Challenges the idea/s or position/s within a rabbinic text that conflict with a personal value.	RVC.31c Generates personal religious questions that arise when studying challenging texts.
		Text Examples: difference between Jews and Gentiles, concept of chosenness	Text Examples: women and Torah study (M. Sota 3:4); misplaced tolerance as leading to the destruction of the Temple	Text Examples: mitzvot that are considered "equal to all others" such as brit (BT Nedarim 32a); tzizit (BT Menahot 43b); Torah study (BT Kiddushin 40a)

		and exile (BT Gittin 56a)	
Seeking to Understand Challenging Texts	RVC.32a Speaks in the voice of a rabbinic position that is personally challenging.	RVC.32b Defends a rabbinic decision that is personally challenging.  Text Examples: women's roles (Bt Shabbat 62a, BT Berakhot 17b, BT Ketubot 65a)	RVC.32c Justifies a rabbinic value position that is in conflict with a personal value based on an understanding of context and considerations surrounding the position.  Text Examples: R' Shimon's attitude to gentiles (BT Bava Metzi'a 114b, BT Yevamoth 61a and BT Keritot 6b)
Seeking to Understand Challenging Texts (cont.)	RVC.32d Examines responses to challenging ethical or ritual situations or questions within a rabbinic text and defends one of the responses as most fitting.  Text Examples: Should you negotiate with kidnappers to ransom a captive? (BT Gittin 45a)	RVC.32e Draws a connection between a challenging rabbinic position and the context from which it emerged.  Text Examples: connection between "Sanctification of the Name" and Roman oppression. (BT Berakhot 61b)	RVC.32f Develops a support and critique of a value decision in a rabbinic text that conflicts with a widely held contemporary value position.  Text Examples: Rabbinic approach to education: (BT Bava Batra 21a, BT Eruvin 53a, BT Ta'anit 7a, BT Avodah Zarah 18b, BT Horayot 13a)

<b>Engaging Rabbinic</b>	RVC.33a Evaluates the	RVC.33b Compares	RVC.33c Compares ethical	RVC.33d Formulates a
Value Commitments	implementation of a	decisions rabbis	norms in rabbinic texts to	personal response to a
in Dialogue	specific rabbinic	confronted in a particular	Jewish ethical norms from	complex ethical question
iii Dialogue	value/practice in the	rabbinic text to a related	different historical	raised in a rabbinic text
	classroom.	contemporary value	periods.	employing contemporary
		decision.	Text Examples: Jewish/	Jewish sources as support.
	Text Examples: Lo		Gentile relations	
	tit'godedu should all	Text Examples: two	throughout the ages (BT	Text Examples: point of
	birthday cakes be gluten	people traveling with only	<u>H</u> ullin 94a, BT Bava	death and organ donation
	free to make sure	1 canteen of water (BT	Kamma 113b, BT	(BT Yoma 85a)
	everyone can participate	Bava Metzi'a 62a)	Sanhedrin 76b & 105a,	
	equally?		Medieval sources:	
			commentary of the Meiri	
			on the above sources v.	
			those of Maimonides,	
			Later authorities: Rabbi	
			Yechiel Yaakov Weinberg)	
<b>Engaging Rabbinic</b>	RVC.33e Justifies a	RVC.33f Provides several	RVC.33g Defends a	RVC.33h Predicts the
<b>Value Commitments</b>	personal response to a	possible personal	personal response to an	rabbinic response to a
in Dialogue	"tough question" raised by	responses to an ethical	ethical question found in a	contemporary solution to
(cont.)	a rabbinic text.	question found in a	rabbinic source drawing	a challenging ethical
(cont.)		rabbinic source.	on values expressed in	rabbinic position.
			rabbinic texts.	
	Text Examples: When	Text Examples:		
	should a child disobey	Responding to R' Akiva's	Text Examples: Who or	Text Examples: Jewish/
	one's parents? (See – BT	predicament of candle	what is considered a	Gentile relations and
	Yevamot 6a, BT Bava	being blown out (BT	rodef/pursuer (BT	various rabbinic decrees
	Metzi'a 32a, BT Megillah	Berakhot 60b); When	Sanhedrin 72a-b)	enacted to maintain
	16b, BT Kiddushin 32b)	should a child disobey		separateness i.e. wine,
		one's parents? (BT		bread, etc. (BT Avodah
		Yevamot 6a, BT Bava		Zarah 35b)
		Metzi'a 32a and BT		
		Megillah 16b, BT		
		Kiddushin 32b)		

Organizing Principle #4: Applying rabbinic value commitments to new situations.

How might rabbinic texts contribute to contemporary conversations around values?

What would it look like for me to take a particular text, value, or idea seriously?

Theme	K-2	3-5	6-8	9-12
	Pre-Text	Beginning	Intermediate	Advanced
Connecting to Rabbinic Value Commitments	RVC.40a Uses rabbinic terms in order to label common experiences in immediate surroundings (family, home, school).	RVC.40b Uses examples from personal life experiences to identify and define specific rabbinic values.	RVC.40c Articulates rabbinic values or value categories underlying rules found in personal life.	RVC.40d Identifies the rabbinic values at play on each side of a contemporary dilemma.
	השבת :Text Examples השבת אבידה, בקור חולים, הכרת הטוב, דן לכף זכות	השבת :השבת השבת אבידה, בקור חולים, הכרת הטוב, דן לכף זכות	Text Examples: returning lost objects (BT Bava Metzi'a 21a)	Text Examples: connection between benefit and responsibility i.e. renting v. borrowing a car (BT Bava Metzi'a 93a and 33b)
Connecting to Rabbinic Value Commitments (cont.)	RVC.40e Describes examples of applying a value within a familiar rabbinic teaching to daily life.	RVC.40f Connects a particular rabbinic value to a contemporary situation.	RVC.40g Connects a moral dilemma found in rabbinic literature to a modern-day experience.	RVC.40h Applies rabbinic texts to evaluate contemporary situations or questions.
	Text Examples: returning lost objects (BT Bava Metzi'a 21a)	Text Examples: guardianship responsibilities (BT Bava Metzi'a 33b)	Text Examples: ransoming captives and captured soldiers like Gilad Shalit (BT Gittin 45a)	

Employing Rabbinic Value Commitments in Communal Decision Making	RVC.41a Submits "questions to the Rabbi" on familiar Jewish topics.	RVC.41b Asks questions about familiar Jewish values or practices to understand their application to contemporary situations.	RVC.41c Formulates a question of Jewish practice following the model of questions in responsa literature.	RVC.41d Explains the rabbinic value commitments raised by a question in a particular rabbinic responsa.
		Text Examples: can a synagogue accept tzedaka from a person who is known to have stolen funds?	Text Examples: medical ethics such as cloning, technological developments and Shabbat observance.	Text Examples: responsa literature from the holocaust. responsa regarding the resettling of the land of Israel (shemitah, tithes, etc.)
Employing Rabbinic Value Commitments in Personal Decision Making	RVC.42a Identifies rabbinic values that help me to do the right thing in daily life.	RVC.42b Analyzes the rabbinic values at play in formulating a response to a particular contemporary question.	RVC.42c Evaluates explicit or implicit Jewish values in their original context and applies them in responding to a modern day situation.	RVC.42d Justifies a personal response to an ethical question citing rabbinic sources.
	Text Examples: teshuva - offending or transgressing and seeking forgiveness through reparation (from God and people)	Text Examples: urban planning based on environmental concerns (M. Bava Batra 2:8-10)	<b>Text Examples:</b> גנבת הדעת - deceiving others (BT <u>H</u> ulin 94a)	Text Examples: environmental legislation, urban planning, vegetarianism, animal rights
Employing Rabbinic Value Commitments in Personal Decision Making (cont.)	RVC.42e Applies core Jewish values in rabbinic teachings to personal actions.  Text Examples: Kallah na'ah v'chasudah and boundaries of truth telling	RVC.42f Develops rules for contemporary situations based on learned rabbinic values.  Text Examples: classroom rules based on tzelem elokim and kayod	RVC.42g Develops a personal hierarchy of values to determine a personal response to an ethical question.  Text Examples: avoiding speaking leshon hara (BT	RVC.42h Defends a position on an ethical dilemma drawing on understandings of the rabbinic values at play.  Text Examples: Income equity, market regulations, restrictions on
	(BT Ketubot 16b-17a)	ha'briyot	Arakhin 16a)	charging interest, prosbul.

	I	T		1
Employing Rabbinic Value Commitments in Personal Decision Making (cont.)	RVC.42i Explains what it means to be more "strict" or "lenient" in a given situation	RVC.42j Lists areas in personal Jewish practice where it is important to be strict and areas where it is important to be lenient.  Text Examples:  Shabbat Judging others Speech Kashrut Conversion standards Ritual v. Civil Law	RVC.42k Develops criteria for following the stricter or more lenient approach to a particular question.  Text Examples: Shabbat enjoyment v. taking Shabbat "lightly" (BT Betzah 2b and the dispute between Rebi (R.) Yehuda and Rebi Shimon)	RVC.42I Articulates personal reasons for taking a more strict approach to a value vs. a more lenient one (or vice versa) by utilizing precedence.
Internalizing Value Commitments  Acts in a way that illustrates/illuminates an internalization of a value gleaned from the text.	RVC.43a Participates in an act that illustrates/illuminates a value gleaned from the text.	RVC.43b Initiates action that is in line with a value gleaned from the text.	RVC.43c Commits to regularly engaging in actions/behaviors based on a particular value gleaned from the text.	RVC.43d Influences others to act in accordance with a particular value gleaned from the text.

William Davidson Graduate School of Jewish Education

## Legacy Heritage Instructional Leadership Institute



## **Textual Access**

Students will develop the skills to read, navigate and comprehend a variety of genres of rabbinic literature, fostering the ability to understand rabbinic texts independently.

Rabbinic texts are foundational to Jewish tradition, yet the barriers of language, genre, style, and comprehension can feel insurmountable to our students, leaving them without independent contact and engagement with Rabbinic tradition. Much like the *shomer ha-petach* (gate keeper) who keeps students out of Rabban Gamliel's *beit midrash* (*Berachot* 28a), this reality has greatly limited the number of students who can become competent learners of Rabbinic texts and participants in shaping Rabbinic Judaism. This standard is designed to address this issue, focusing on the skills and knowledge needed to help students navigate and understand Rabbinic texts, including Mishna, Midrash, and Talmud.

This standard focuses on several key areas of skills acquisition in order to facilitate understanding of rabbinic texts in their original language, affording students unmediated access the world of rabbinic literature. Successful implementation of this standard will allow students to develop a sense of ownership, competence, and motivation towards lifelong learning of rabbinic literature.

In order to accomplish this goal, this standard has focused on several key areas of skill acquisition, including navigation of texts and tools, fluency with background information assumed by the text, understandings of genre and style, as well as vocabulary, language and translation. Successful synthesis of these skills will lead to understanding of the ideas, arguments and values of Rabbinic literature, allowing students to feel at home within - and derive meaning from - the world of Jewish textual tradition. It should be emphasized that this standard does not advocate a pedagogy of lists and memorization, but is geared towards synthesis and application of a diverse skillset to empower our students to both understand and become impacted by their learning of Rabbinic texts. Additionally, while many examples in the benchmarks below derive from Mishnaic or Talmudic texts, this standard is designed to prepare students for engagement in a wide range of Rabbinic literature.

DRAFT DOCUMENT NOT FOR DISTRIBUTION

### **Textual Access**

**Standard:** Students will develop the skills to read, navigate and comprehend a variety of genres of rabbinic literature, fostering the ability to understand rabbinic texts independently.

### Preamble:

Rabbinic texts are foundational to Jewish tradition, yet the barriers of language, genre, style, and comprehension can feel insurmountable to our students, leaving them without independent contact and engagement with Rabbinic tradition. Much like the *shomer ha-petach* (gate keeper) who keeps students out of Rabban Gamliel's *beit midrash* (BT Berakhot 28a), this reality has greatly limited the number of students who can become competent learners of Rabbinic texts and participants in shaping Rabbinic Judaism. This standard is designed to address this issue, focusing on the skills and knowledge needed to help students navigate and understand Rabbinic texts, including Mishna, Midrash, and Talmud.

This standard focuses on several key areas of skills acquisition in order to facilitate understanding of rabbinic texts in their original language, affording students unmediated access the world of rabbinic literature. Successful implementation of this standard will allow students to develop a sense of ownership, competence, and motivation towards lifelong learning of rabbinic literature.

In order to accomplish this goal, this standard has focused on several key areas of skill acquisition, including navigation of texts and tools, fluency with background information assumed by the text, understandings of genre and style, as well as vocabulary, language and translation. Successful synthesis of these skills will lead to understanding of the ideas, arguments and values of Rabbinic literature, allowing students to feel at home within - and derive meaning from - the world of Jewish textual tradition. It should be emphasized that this standard does not advocate a pedagogy of lists and memorization, but is geared towards synthesis and application of a diverse skillset to empower our students to both understand and become impacted by their learning of Rabbinic texts. Additionally, while many examples in the benchmarks below derive from Mishnaic or Talmudic texts, this standard is designed to prepare students for engagement in a wide range of Rabbinic literature.

### **Organizing Principles:**

- 1. Navigation: How do I find the text I am looking for? What tools will help me find them?
  - Students will learn to find, identify, and navigate among rabbinic texts using a variety of traditional and contemporary tools. These tools may include supplemental texts found on a particular page of rabbinic literature, books on the shelves of the *beit midrash*, references from one text to another, or digital search tools.
- 2. Background Information: What background information do I need in order to learn this text?

Both a prerequisite and a desired outcome of studying rabbinic literature is a familiarity with information that the text assumes the reader already knows. Basic information includes cultural frameworks like background knowledge on figures (i.e. הלל) referenced in a particular text, particular concepts (i.e. asur/patur) discussed within the text, and historical background information. This is information that students develop over time that will help them to make sense of rabbinic texts.

- 3. Genre: What are the distinctive literary features I should expect to find when I open a particular genre of rabbinic literature? Students will study the definitions of specific genres of rabbinic literature, explore their literary characteristics, build a toolbox of how to approach a particular genre of text, develop an expectation of what to expect when reading a particular text, and discover how each genre "works." (Genres of rabbinic literature include midrash, mishnah, gemara aggadah & halakha, and codes, among others.)
- 4. Translation: What do the words and sentences in this text say?

Students will understand words and syntax in order to create a coherent and sustainable initial read of the component parts of a larger piece of text leading to the ability to re-articulate that reading in their own words. To this end, students will develop the skills necessary to explain the definition and function of words and technical terms, gain an understanding of grammar, and learn to parse, punctuate, and vocalize a text.

5. Comprehension: What does this textual unit mean?

The goal of comprehension is to make sense of a text, alone or with commentaries, in a way that goes beyond translation. Students will explore the assertions and arguments embedded in the text in order to develop a coherent understanding of a text by synthesizing and utilizing vocabulary, background information, context, reference tools, commentaries, and more.

### **Benchmarks**

Organizing Principle #1: Navigation

How do I find the text I am looking for?

What tools will help me find them?

Theme	K-2	3-5	6-8	9-12
	Pre-Text	Beginning	Intermediate	Advanced
Locating Rabbinic Texts	TA.10a Associates Hebraic letters with their number equivalents.	TA.10b Locates a text using letter-number equivalents.		
Page Navigation	TA.11a Recognize that some Jewish books have unique layouts	TA.11b Identifies the mishnah vs. the commentaries on a page of Mishnah.	TA.11c Identifies the components of a daf gemara on the page of the Vilna edition.  Examples: Mishnah, Gemara, Rashi, Tosafot	TA.11d Recognizes layout and structure of key rabbinic works.  Examples: Mishneh Torah, Shulhan Arukh, Sefer ha-Hinukh, Mishnah Berurah
Page Navigation (cont.)	TA.11e Locates a verse in the <u>h</u> umash by chapter and verse.	TA.11f Locates a mishnah in a masekhet by chapter and mishnah.	TA.11g Locates a page in a Vilna Shas by masekhet, daf and amud.	TA.11h Locates a passage in a later rabbinic work.  Examples: Mishneh Torah, Shulhan Arukh, Sefer ha-Hinukh, Mishnah Berurah

73

Page Navigation (cont.)		TA.11i Identifies biblical quotation/s within a rabbinic texts.	TA.11j Follows reference/citation links on a page of Talmud.  Examples: Locates a biblical quotation, finds a parallel source, etc. תורה אור, עין משפט נר מצוה, מסורת הש״ס, גליון הש״ס	TA.11k Uses an electronic databases to locate the page of a particular rabbinic text.  Examples: Bar Ilan, Sefaria
Commentary Navigation	TA.12a Recognizes the difference between Rashi script and regular Hebrew script.	TA.12b Locates the dibur hamathil in a Rashi comment corresponding to a given word or phrase in Tanakh.	TA.12c Locates the dibur hamathil in Rashi or Tosafot corresponding to a given word or phrase of gemara.	TA.12d Locates commentary of a <i>Rishon</i> that isn't found on the standard Vilna daf.  Examples: Ramban, Ritva, Rashba, Rosh, RIf
Library Navigation	TA.13a Recognizes the terms used to distinguish between a variety of Jewish texts.  Examples: Torah she'bikhtav vs. Torah she-be'al peh, gemara vs. humash	TA.13b Matches basic themes and subject matter to each of the six orders of the Mishnah.	TA.13c Knows how to find a particular mishnah on a bookshelf in a beit midrash or class library.	TA.13d Selects the proper masekhet based on theme or subject matter.

# Organizing Principle #2: Background Information What background information do I need in order to learn this text?

Theme	K-2 Pre-Text	3-5 Beginning	6-8 Intermediate	9-12 Advanced	
Rabbinic Figures	TA.20a Retells aggadot connected to key figures in mishna.	TA.20b Connects the names of key figures in rabbinic literature to particular rulings or aggadot.  Examples: Hillel, Shammai, Rabbi Akiva	TA.20c Identifies names of key rabbinic figures and places them in the correct rabbinic period.	TA.20d Connects key rulings to central figures of the gemara.	
Historical Background	TA.21a Distinguishes between figures in Tanakh and key figures in rabbinic literature.  Examples: recognizes that Rabbi Akiva isn't a biblical figure	TA.21b Identifies periods of Rabbinic history and connects these periods to key rabbinic figures.  Examples: tanaim, amoraim, rishonim, etc)	TA.21c Constructs timelines of rabbinic history and major works.	TA.21d Places key events of rabbinic history into the context of world history.  Examples: Roman empire and destruction of second temple	
Conceptual Fluency	TA.22a Applies key rabbinic concepts to familiar Jewish practices.  Examples: what makes a sukkah or chanukiya כשר פסול	TA.22b Explains basic Rabbinic concepts.  Examples: מלאכה, מלאכה, חמותר/אסור, כשר/פסול, חייב/פטור	TA.22c Explains advanced Rabbinic conceptual frameworks. Examples: מצוות עשה שהזמן גרמא, טמא/טהור	TA.22d Anticipates which rabbinic concepts will be raised within a particular context or discussion.	

Ritual Fluency  TA.23a Demonstrat appropriate use of a object.		TA.23c Identifies the source of a ritual as biblical or rabbinic.	TA.23d Traces the development of a particular ritual from its roots to contemporary practice.
--	--	---	---

### Organizing Principle #3: Genre

What are the distinctive literary features I should expect to find when I open a particular genre of rabbinic literature?

Theme	K-2 Pre-Text	3-5 Beginning	6-8 Intermediate	9-12 Advanced
Distinguishes Between Genres of Rabbinic Literature	TA.30a Distinguishes between the Torah and other Jewish texts.  Examples: Siddur, Haggadah	TA.30b Differentiates between Tanakh and midrash.	TA.30c Describes distinct features of Mishnah and Talmud.	TA.30d Differentiates distinct features and goals of <i>mikra</i> , mishnah, gemara/talmud, <i>midrash halakhah</i> , <i>midrash aggadah</i> , commentaries and codes (Rambam, Shul <u>h</u> an Arukh).
Distinguishes Between Genres of Rabbinic Literature (cont.)	TA.30e Distinguishes between Torah shebikhtav and Torah shebe'al peh.	TA.30f Describes the relationship between torah she-b'chtav and torah she-ba'al peh.	TA.30g Describes the relationship between Mishnah and Talmud.	TA.30h Describes the relationship between the Bavli, Yerushalmi and Tosefta.  Examples: stylistic or structural differences between Bavli and Yerushalmi, as well as competition between Bavel and Eretz Yisrael communities for political and intellectual power

77

Key Features of Mishnah, Talmud and Rishonim	TA.31a Describes the purpose behind various Jewish texts.  Examples: siddur vs. chumash vs. midrash vs. haggadah	TA.31b Describes key features of mishnaic texts.  Examples: short sentences, emphasis on law, rarely includes narrative, Biblical quotations, or explanations	TA.31c Identifies distinguishing features of the Talmud.	TA.31d Describes the styles of various Rishonim.  Examples: Rambam (code), Rif (digest), Yad Ramah (running commentary)
Key Features of Midrash	TA.32a Recognizes the difference between Torah text and specific midrashim.	TA.32b Describes distinct features of midrash.  Examples: add clarity or details to the Torah's words and narratives	TA.32c Identifies whether a particular midrash is halachic or aggadic.	

# Organizing Principle #4: Translation What do the words and sentences in this text say?

Theme	K-2 Pre-Text	3-5 Beginning	6-8 Intermediate	9-12 Advanced
Mivneh HaSugyah	TA.40a Identifies components of a Jewish story.  Examples: question, conflict, resolution, moral lesson	TA.40b Divides a mishnah text into its component parts.  Examples: reisha/seifa, positions in a mahloket	TA.40c Identifies component parts of a Talmudic deliberation.  Examples: מימרא, קושיא ותרוץ, סתירה, ראיה	TA.40d Distinguishes between historical layers of a Talmudic text  Examples: tannaim, amoraim, stamaim
	TA.40e Explains a rabbinic disagreement around an important topic.	TA.40f Identifies the main point of disagreement within a simple rabbinic text.	TA.40g Maps the flow of a discussion or argument within a particular sugya noting the function of key structural terms.  Examples: איתמר, תנא, קמ״ל	VIC.30d Employs the commentaries of select Rishonim to analyze the flow of the discussion or arguments within a sugya.
Grammar, Word Structure, and Morphology	TA.41a Acquires vocabulary of common Hebrew shorashim	TA.41b Identifies the שורש of unfamiliar Hebrew words encountered in a text.	TA.41c Identifies the שורש of a common Aramaic word.	TA.41d Acquires a vocabulary of frequent Aramaic words/roots.
	עשה, אמר, Examples: עשה, אמר דבר, היה, עמד, קרא, אכל			נפק, פלג :Examples

Grammar, Word Structure, and Morphology (cont.)	TA.41e Uses prefixes or prepositions in Hebrew words  Examples: ל, מ, ל	TA.41f Identifies and translates prefixes and suffixes to a given Hebrew word  Examples: וב, -הם, -ו, -נו	TA.41g Translates common Aramaic prefixes and suffixes. Examples: יה, -נא, -נן, -הו	TA.41h Parses a given Aramaic verb to identify its root, gender, number, and person  Examples: first/third person, active/passive verb
Grammar, Word Structure, and Morphology (cont.)			TA.41i Identifies different Hebrew binyanim and how they transform the meaning of a given שורש.	TA.41j Explains the changing meaning of a particular aramaic root as it appears in different forms.  Examples: changing forms of the root "קטל" (סנהדרין עד)
Key Words and Terms	TA.42a Acquires vocabulary of common Hebrew transition words  Examples: אבל, ו, אלא,	TA.42b Identifies key "transition words" in a Mishnaic sentence.  Examples: אבל, ו, אלא, שנאמר, אמר	TA.42c Uses transition words to aid in the punctuation of a Talmudic text.	
Key Words and Terms (cont.)		TA.42d Recognizes and explains the most commonly used abbreviations.  Examples: ת"ר, הקב"ה	TA.42e Recognizes common aramaic terms within a rabbinic text.  Examples: התםהכא, איכא/ליכא, אין, דילמא, אמר	TA.42f Translates and explains the meaning and function of key structural cues/terms in rabbinic texts.  Examples: introduce a challenge, answer a

			question
Key Words and Terms (cont.)	TA.42g Recognizes common speech patterns in a Mishnaic text  Examples: parallelism, repetition	TA.42h Distinguishes between Hebrew and Aramaic words.	TA.42i Identifies letters that switch between equivalent Hebrew and Aramaic words.
Translation	TA.43b Uses context clues to understand the meaning of a word.	TA.43c Constructs an initial translation of a block of text.	TA.43d Selects the most appropriate translation of a word or phrase (from among several options) using contextual or linguistic clues within the broader text.
Translation (cont.)		TA.43e Identifies similarities and differences between teacher provided versions of related texts.	TA.43f Compares and contrasts different גרסאות of a Rabbinic text.
Refining, Revising, Reconstructing		TA.44c Corrects an initial translation of a text when prompted.	TA.44d Independently identifies and revises errors in an initial translation of a text.

Reference Tools	TA.45b Translates Mishnaic texts with the assistance of a teacher-provided word bank.	TA.45c Uses dictionary resources to effectively translate a select passage of a rabbinic text.  Examples: dictionary, glossary, word bank	TA.45d Independently selects the appropriate dictionary or reference tool to use during an initial translation of a rabbinic text.
Reference Tools (cont.)	TA.45e Uses a dictionary or online language tool to look up Hebrew words.	TA.45f Identifies multiple possible meanings of a given word or phrase using a dictionary or other reference material.	TA.45g Selects the most fitting definition of a given word or phrase from multiple options cited in a dictionary.
Reference Tools (cont.)	TA.45h Accurately reads in Rashi script.	TA.45i Translates and applies a teacher provided Rashi commentary to a Talmudic passage to aid in the translation of the passage.	TA.45j Independently consults Rashi's commentary to enhance understanding of the text.

## Organizing Principle #5: Comprehension What does this textual unit mean?

Theme	K-2 Pre-Text	3-5 Beginning	6-8 Intermediate	9-12 Advanced
Questions	TA.50a Asks questions about a rabbinic story or text.	TA.50b Summarizes a text's key questions.	TA.50c Infers a text's key questions when not explicitly stated in the text.	
Midrash: Recognizing Textual Difficulties		TA.51b Anticipates questions about a biblical text.  Examples: difficult or unusual words from a biblical text	TA.51c Summarizes the explanation of a textual difficulty offered by a particular midrash.  Examples: אין נא אלא לשון midrashim; BT Sanhedrin 108a on Genesis 6:10; BT Bavli Berakhot 31b on Hannah and Tz'evaot	TA.51d Compares the explanations of a textual difficulty offered by multiple midrashim.
Mishna, Gemara, Rishonim: Recognizing Textual Difficulties	TA.52a Identifies gaps, omissions, or ideas in a biblical text that lack clarity and will need to be addressed in a rabbinic text.	TA.52b Explains the rabbinic resolution to a gap, contradiction, or omission in a biblical or rabbinic text.	TA.52c Analyzes the different approaches the gemara or later commentaries use to respond to gaps, omissions, or problems within a rabbinic text.	TA.52d Distinguishes between a problem with translation/ comprehension of a text vs. a problem or contradiction within the text itself through an

				analysis of rishonim or acharonim.
Explaining Rabbinic Texts	TA.53a Retells a rabbinic story in sequence.  Examples: kibbud Av V'Em story - Dama b. Netina who won't wake his father to get the key to the safe	TA.53b Summarizes the central idea of a familiar rabbinic text.	TA.53c Summarizes the question/s, proof/s, and argument/s within a familiar rabbinic text.	TA.53d Explains an unseen rabbinic text.
Explaining Rabbinic Texts (cont.)		TA.53e Explains different midrashic readings of a particular biblical law or narrative.  Examples: בסוכות תשבו - what does it mean to live somewhere?	TA.53f Analyzes the theme(s), and ideas in a Rabbinic narrative.  Examples: Hanina ben dosa stories on miracle working, Rabbi Akiva stories on water dripping	TA.53g Applies tools of literary criticism in the analysis of a Rabbinic text.  Examples: wordplay, pun, suspense, irony, character representation and narrative structure (triads, chiasm, etc)
Explaining Commentaries		TA.54b Explains how a commentary on the Mishna provides an explanation to a problem in the text.	TA.54c Accurately summarizes a problem raised by Rashi about a gemara, and explains Rashi's resolution.	TA.54d Identifies the problem that Tosafot raises and accurately summarizes the resolution.
Interpretation		TA.55b Compares multiple interpretations among commentaries to a Mishnaic text.	TA.55c Identifies a "חקירה" - a conceptual issue that may be driving a rabbinic dispute.  Examples: "מה מאחורי in the Talmud or Rishonim	TA.55d Compares multiple possible interpretations among <i>rishonim</i> to a Talmudic text.  Examples: מחלוקת רש״יי

Interpretation (cont.)	TA.55d Describes what is personally interesting about a rabbinic text or story.	TA.55e Shares a lesson that Chazal is expressing within a rabbinic statement or text.  Examples: what does the phrase חברותא או מיתותא mean?	TA.55f Shares personal relevance of a rabbinic text or statement.  Examples: what does the phrase חברותא או מיתותא mean to me?	
Fluent Reading	TA.56a Accurately reads Hebrew words.	TA.56b Fluently reads a vocalized Hebrew text.	TA.56c Fluently reads a vocalized Hebrew and Aramic rabbinic text with intonation that conveys the meaning or tone of each statement.	TA.56d Fluently reads an unvocalized rabbinic text in the original language.
Vocalizing Texts		TA.57b Punctuates a familiar rabbinic text to demonstrate comprehension.  Examples: question mark at end of a challenge, exclamation at end of a proof	TA.57c Punctuates an unfamiliar rabbinic text to demonstrate comprehension.	

William Davidson Graduate School of Jewish Education

## Legacy Heritage Instructional Leadership Institute



## **Voices in Conversation**

Students will understand rabbinic literature as multi-vocal and interpretive and will cultivate their own place within the tradition of *Torah shebe'al peh* and its community of interpreters.

Rabbinic texts are the central building blocks of the dynamic and multivocal Jewish interpretive tradition of *Torah shebe'al peh*. Through this standard, students will understand that the tradition of *Torah shebe'al peh* is built through the distinctive interpretive practices and forms of rabbinic literature. Rabbinic literature is interpretive and intertextual. It is characterized by a multiplicity of interpretive and argumentative voices that stand in dialogue with one another and with earlier biblical and rabbinic texts in a never-ending interpretive chain. By immersing themselves in the study of rabbinic texts, students will shape their own habits of inquiry and discourse, express their own opinions in dialogue with rabbinic texts, and articulate how they may claim their own places in this eternal Jewish conversation.

### **Voices in Conversation**

### Standard:

Students will understand rabbinic literature as multi-vocal and interpretive and will cultivate their own place within the tradition of *Torah shebe'al peh* and its community of interpreters.

#### **VIC Preamble:**

Rabbinic texts are the central building blocks of the dynamic and multivocal Jewish interpretive tradition of *Torah she-be'al peh*. Through this standard, students will understand that the tradition of *Torah shebe'al peh* is built through the distinctive interpretive practices and forms of rabbinic literature. Rabbinic literature is interpretive and intertextual. It is characterized by a multiplicity of interpretive and argumentative voices that stand in dialogue with one another and with earlier biblical and rabbinic texts in a neverending interpretive chain. By immersing themselves in the study of rabbinic texts, students will shape their own habits of inquiry and discourse, express their own opinions in dialogue with rabbinic texts, and articulate how they may claim their own places in this eternal Jewish conversation.

### **Organizing Principles:**

- 1. Intertextuality Every rabbinic text stands in dialogue with multiple texts across time and place.
- **2. Multiple Voices** Rabbinic texts often include more than one voice.
- **3. Rabbinic Discourse** Talmudic literature in particular is characterized by contrasting voices and argumentation.
- **4. Interpretation** As part of an ongoing process, rabbinic texts interpret earlier texts and then themselves give rise to further interpretation.
- 5. **Torah shebe'al peh** Torah shebe'al peh, the Jewish interpretation of the Torah broadly understood, has been and continues to be an ongoing communal process in which Jewish readers participate through immersion in the study of rabbinic texts.

  \*\*DRAFT DOCUMENT NOT FOR DISTRIBUTION\*\*

  97

### **Benchmarks**

Organizing Principle #1 Intertextuality - Every rabbinic text stands in dialogue with multiple texts across time and place.

Theme	K-2 Pre-Text	3-5 Beginning	6-8 Intermediate	9-12 Advanced
Relationship Between Biblical and Rabbinic Texts and Among Rabbinic Texts	VIC.10a Distinguishes between a text from the Torah and a midrashic teaching.	VIC.10b Discusses the relationship between Tanakh and rabbinic texts.	VIC.10d Differentiates between major works of rabbinic literature.  Examples: Midrash Rabbah; Mekhilta; Pesikta de Rav Kahana, Mishna, Tosefta, Talmud Bavli; Shulchan Arukh, Responsa Literature	VIC.10c Explains the relationships between key rabbinic works.
Development of Major Biblical and Rabbinic Sources	VIC.15a Recalls titles of basic biblical and rabbinic texts in historical order.  Examples: Torah, Neviim, Ketuvim, Mishnah, Gemara	VIC.15b Discusses that specific Jewish learning and practices can be traced back to texts from different time periods.	VIC.15c Distinguishes between the various rabbinic commentaries on a daf of Talmud.	VIC.15d Analyzes how one commentary on a daf of Talmud relates to another commentary on the same daf.

Rabbinic Texts Build Upon Other Biblical/Rabbinic Texts	VIC.11a Recognizes examples where voices in one text quote another voice or text.	VIC.11b Recognizes common terms that signal a reference to another text within a rabbinic passage.	VIC.11c Recognizes a wider variety of terms that signal a reference to another text within a rabbinic passage.  Examples: תנו רבנן, תנו רבנן, שנאמר, דכתיב, תלמוד לומר, מיתיבי, איתמר
Different Literary Elements to Rabbinic Texts		VIC.12a Identifies the different structural elements within a simple rabbinic text.  Examples: case, biblical quotes, questions, story, etc.	VIC.12b Identifies the different structural elements within increasingly complicated/larger segments of rabbinic text.
Development/ Chronology of the Sugya		VIC.13a Identifies the chronological layers within a rabbinic text.  Examples: tannaitic vs. amoraic statements	VIC.13b Describes the role of the redactor in bringing chronological layers into dialogue in a particular text.

Rabbinic Retelling of Biblical and Rabbinic Stories	VIC.14a Identifies a midrashic retelling of a biblical story.	VIC.14b Compares multiple versions of a similar story as it is told in different rabbinic texts.	VIC.14c Explains how a midrashic story is built out of biblical texts.	VIC.14d Identifies the relationships between parallel rabbinic stories.
Cross-Reference Tools			VIC.16a Utilizes the cross-reference tools on a page of Talmud.  Examples: Torah Or, Ein Mishpat Ner Mitzvah, etc.	VIC.16b Inquires into parallel or relevant texts using cross-reference tools on a page of Talmud.
Uses of Technology to Search Parallel Sources and Relevant Texts				VIC.17a Uses technology to search for relevant or parallel texts.  Examples: Bar Ilan Responsa Project Database, Sefaria

Theme	K-2 Pre-Text	3-5 Beginning	6-8 Intermediate	9-12 Advanced
Multiple Voices	VIC.20a Retells aggadot about key tannaitic figures.  Examples: Akiva, Hillel	VIC.20b Identifies multiple voices within a single text.	VIC.20c Connects the multiple people or voices and their opinions within a simple rabbinic text.  Examples: Mishnah, simple sugya	VIC.20d Utilizes textual cues to differentiate between tannaitic, amoraic, and anonymous voices in a talmudic sugya.  Examples: Shift from Aramaic to Hebrew or the reverse, structure, technical terms.
Different Opinions/ Interpretations	VIC.21a Shares multiple possible interpretations of a rabbinic quote or statement.  Examples: Al shlosha devarim ha'olam omed	VIC.21b Creates a dialogue between rabbinic personalities based on a conversation or debate within a particular text.  Examples: Rabbi Akivah & Rabbi Ishmael, Rabban Gamliel & Rabbi Yehoshua	VIC.21c Explains distinct opinions within the Mishnah or a simple rabbinic text.	VIC.21d Evaluates distinct opinions within increasingly complex rabbinic texts.  Examples: Gemara, Midrash, Aggadic Literature

Different Opinions/ Interpretations (cont.)	VIC.21e Retells multiple aggadot about a single biblical character, narrative, or halakhic practice.	VIC.21f Explains a core argument found in rabbinic literature.  Examples: Beit Hillel and Beit Shammai	VIC.21g Explains different midrashic readings of a particular biblical word, phrase, pasuk, event or character.	VIC.21h Utilizes textual cues to distinguish between different voices in a midrashic text.  Examples: different opinions in an anthology
Multiple Interpretations of a Single Text/Topic/Idea	VIC.22a Articulates the pros and cons of having multiple answers to a single question.	VIC.22b Explains multiple answers to a single question provided within a text.	VIC.22c Evaluates the merits of the multiple opinions presented on a single topic or text.	VIC.22d Justifies the multiple opinions presented on a single topic or text.
Multiple Interpretations of a Single Text/Topic/Idea (cont.)	VIC.22e Articulates opinions using prompts about a biblical character, narrative or halakhic practice.	VIC.22f Summarizes the various opinions that appear within a particular rabbinic text.	VIC.22g Justifies different answers to the same question raised in a particular text.	VIC.22h Identifies a shift in perspective within a single commentary.

102

Developing and Considering Possible Answers	VIC.23a Formulates an answer to a question about a text.		VIC.23b Formulates multiple responses to a question asked about a rabbinic text.	VIC.23c Compares and contrasts the different responses of various Rishonim to the same question.  Examples: Rashi provides definitions for difficult or uncommon terms and/or concepts, Tosafot gives primacy to logic and larger swath of consistency
Motivation and Values Underlying Answers	VIC.24a Selects a preferred answer among multiple voices within a rabbinic text and explains the choice.	VIC.24b Infers the value behind multiple answers to a single question.	VIC.24c Infers the motivation behind a particular opinion.	VIC.24d Contextualizes the various opinions on a particular topic.

# Organizing Principle #3: Rabbinic Discourse - Talmudic literature in particular is characterized by contrasting voices and argumentation.

Theme	K-2 Pre-Text	3-5 Beginning	6-8 Intermediate	9-12 Advanced
Identifying the Argument	VIC.30a Explains the main points in a disagreement around an important topic within a rabbinic text.	VIC.30b Identifies the point/s of disagreement within a single rabbinic text.	VIC.30c Maps the flow of a discussion or argument within a particular sugya.	VIC.30d Analyzes how the structure of the sugya is a discussion or argument.
Understanding the Argument	VIC.31a Explains reasons that people argue.	VIC.31b Posits the question/s that led to the argument in a particular rabbinic text.	VIC.31c Proposes the motivation/s behind the arguments forwarded in a particular rabbinic text.	VIC.31d Challenges and justifies the arguments forwarded in a particular rabbinic text.
Evaluating the Minority/Majority Opinions		VIC.32a Identifies the majority and minority opinions in a text.	VIC.32b Justifies minority and majority opinions.	VIC.32c Suggests possible motivation/s for the preservation of minority or rejected opinions in a rabbinic text.
Evaluates Preservation of Minority and Majority Opinions		VIC.33a Articulates the value and purposes of preserving a minority/majority opinion within a disagreement or debate.	VIC.33b Posits why a particular text does or does not come to a resolution.	VIC.33c Evaluates the pros and cons to the lack of final resolution or definitive understanding of many rabbinic texts.

Organizing Principle #4: Interpretation - As part of an ongoing process, rabbinic texts interpret earlier texts and then themselves give rise to further interpretation.

Theme	K-2	3-5	6-8	9-12
	Pre-Text	Beginning	Intermediate	Advanced
Formulates Questions	VIC.40a Asks questions about Torah stories or laws.	VIC.40b Distinguishes between an interpretive question and a question of fact or comprehension.	VIC.40c Formulates interpretive questions on biblical and rabbinic texts.	VIC.40d Differentiates between various levels and types of interpretive questions.
Infers and Anticipates Questions and Suggests Answers	VIC.41a Explains that interpretive questions can have more than one answer.	VIC.41b Predicts interpretive questions that might be asked about a particular biblical or rabbinic text.	VIC.41c Infers the implicit question/s a midrash aggadah or midrash halakhah might be answering.	VIC.41d Raises multiple questions about a text and provides multiple answers to the questions raised.
Identifies the Textual Basis for Rabbinic Interpretations		VIC.42a Identifies ambiguities, gaps or problems in the biblical text.	VIC.42b Explains the ambiguities, gaps or problems in a rabbinic text.	VIC.42c Identifies the textual problem or issues addressed in a rabbinic interpretation or explanation.  Examples: the gap employed by a midrash to forward an interpretation or idea.

Analyzes Midrashic Interpretations	VIC.43a Differentiates between midrash and biblical text.	VIC.43b Explains what a rabbinic midrash adds to or changes in the understanding of a biblical text.	VIC.43c Compares and contrasts multiple interpretations of a biblical text.	VIC.43d Posits the relationship between the social/historical context and textual interpretations.
Traces Biblical Words, Motifs and Narratives from the Bible Through Rabbinic Interpretations	VIC.44a Compares and contrasts two parallel biblical narratives.	VIC.44b Traces the development of a biblical character, verse, term, or motif in the bible.	VIC.44c Identifies Rabbinic contexts where the meaning of Biblical words or phrases are altered.  Examples: (in legal texts) v'shamru b'nei yisrael. Its version in the biblical text, vs. what it means in a Rabbinic text.	VIC.44d Traces a biblical pasuk, motif, or narrative through multiple rabbinic interpretations.
Evaluates Multiple Interpretations	VIC.45a Articulates that there can be more than one interpretation of a verse, narrative, idea.	VIC.45b Explains why there are multiple interpretations to a verse, narrative or concept.	VIC.45c Compares and contrasts multiple interpretations of a rabbinic text.	vic.45d Infers the variety of possible assumptions, motivations and/or values behind a specific interpretation.
Distinguishes Between Pshat and Drash	VIC.46a Suggests the meaning or interpretations of specific words in Rabbinic texts.  Examples: Pirkei Avot. use of word gibor	VIC.46b Identifies the use of biblical verses to support or prove a stated opinion.	VIC.46c Differentiates between the use of the biblical verse in a rabbinic text (sugya, midrash, etc.) and the verse's meaning in the biblical context.	VIC.46d Distinguishes between pshat and drash (midrash halakhah and aggadah) interpretations of a biblical text.

Rabbinic Commentary	VIC.47a Summarizes the main message of a rabbinic commentary.	VIC.47b Offers multiple potential meanings for a given word, phrase, idea, or text based on	VIC.47c Identifies the issue in the text to which a commentator responds.	VIC.47d Differentiates between the various interpretive approaches of the talmudic
		interpretations offered in a rabbinic commentary.	Examples: Is Rashi providing a definition or necessary background information, offering a sevara, serving as a recorder/preserver of midrashic traditions	commentators.
Considers the Relationship Between Historical Context/ Development and Rabbinic Interpretations	VIC.48a Explains the relationship between Jewish learning and Jewish history.	VIC.48b Recalls specific time periods of Jewish history as they relate to text development.	VIC.48c Explores different ways to account for a rabbinic interpretation.  Examples: textual, ideological, historical, literary	VIC.48d Explains how the various chronological layers of a rabbinic text or sugya are interpretive.
Considers the Historical Context/ Development and Rabbinic Interpretations (cont.)				VIC.48e Evaluates the strengths and weaknesses of textual interpretations based on a variety of criteria.  Examples: textual, meaning, precedent, etc.

Organizing Principle #5: Torah shebe'al peh - Torah shebe'al peh, the Jewish interpretation of the Torah broadly understood, has been and continues to be an ongoing communal process in which Jewish readers participate through immersion in the study of rabbinic texts.

Theme	K-2	3-5	6-8	9-12
	Pre-Text	Beginning	Intermediate	Advanced
Generates Multiple Answers and Interpretations	VIC.50a Offers two different answers to the same question.	VIC.50b Formulates multiple possible interpretations of a text.	VIC.50c Generates multiple answers to a single textual question using textual evidence.	VIC.50d Justifies multiple personal interpretations that explain textual gaps or ambiguities using textual evidence for support.
Developing Dispositions: Demonstrates Perspective, Openness, Humility and Rethinking	VIC.51a Demonstrates ability to engage in perspective-taking.	VIC.51b Demonstrates openness to the possibility of the text having multiple meanings.	VIC.51c Approaches the act of interpreting sacred texts with respect and humility.	VIC.51d Embraces the learning of rabbinic text as an iterative process that requires constant rereading, rethinking and renewed understanding.
Balancing Voicing and Listening to Interpretations (Text or Person)	VIC.52a Seeks out others' opinions about a text or issue.	VIC.52b Summarizes the opinion of others before expressing a personal opinion about a text.	VIC.52c Invites multiple interpretive voices from among one's peers into the learning process.	VIC.52d Evaluates the strengths and weaknesses of others' interpretations that emerge from the close reading of the text.

Balancing Voicing and Listening to Interpretations (Text or Person) (cont.)	VIC.52e Articulates personal interpretation of a rabbinic story.	VIC.52f Advocates for a particular interpretation of the text (offered by rabbinic/modern commentator or peer) using evidence from the text.	VIC.52g Examines classic commentary and/or multiple voices within the rabbinic text to serve as models for how to engage the ideas and interpretations of others.	VIC.52h Justifies an interpretation of text based on historical and social context.
Identifies and Explains Ambiguity and Multiple Perspectives in the Text	VIC.53a Explains several lessons found in a rabbinic text or story.	VIC.53b Distinguishes various points of view implied by a rabbinic text.	VIC.53c Suggests ambiguities in the text that can be used to develop multiple interpretations of the text.	VIC.53d Analyzes texts in ways that acknowledge the fact that there are voices that are not or are rarely reflected in the text.  Examples: the voices of women, of laypeople
Personal Questions	VIC.54a Raises questions about a rabbinic text.  Examples: What don't we know about this story? What details are missing about how to enact this law?	VIC.54b Asks clarifying questions based on a close reading of text.	VIC.54c Generates interpretive questions when looking at a text.	VIC.54d Asks questions or raises difficulties that arise when reading a rabbinic text.  Examples: personal, social, logic, Torah values, other texts

Justifies Personal Interpretation	VIC.55a Responds to specific rabbinic texts using a personal interpretation.  Examples: Makes inferences about a text or picture based on evidence/clues in the text or picture.	VIC.55b Justifies or explains a personal interpretation of a basic rabbinic text.	VIC.55c Explains what is motivating a personal interpretation of a rabbinic text.	VIC.55d Compares and contrasts a personal interpretation within the history of Jewish interpretation.
Justifies Personal Interpretation (cont.)	VIC.55e Explains a personal interpretation of a story.	VIC.55f Offers a personal interpretation of a biblical story using textual support.	VIC.55g Defends a personal interpretation of the text with appropriate evidence both from the current text and a different rabbinic text.	VIC.55h Offers a personal interpretation based on textual support drawing from texts outside of the text that is being interpreted.
Demonstrates Empathy for Others' Interpretation	VIC.56a Speaks in the "voice" of a character or position within the text.	VIC.56b Formulates an interpretation from the perspective of a voice within the text.	VIC.56c Creates a textual interpretation utilizing the tools and approaches modeled in the text/s.	VIC.56d Defends the perspective of a voice within the text utilizing the history and social context of that voice.
Derives Values from Text for Contemporary Times	VIC.57a Derives a personal or communal lesson to be taken from a rabbinic text.	VIC.57b Identifies important contemporary contexts in need of response.	VIC.57c Connects rabbinic texts, values and discussions to contemporary contexts and issues.	VIC.57d Evaluates the rabbinic texts, values and conversations underlying contemporary contexts and issues.

Co-Constructs Textual Meaning with Chavruta (Building on Responses)	VIC.58a Summarizes and explains another person's opinion.	VIC.58b Engages in a focused "give and take" conversation with a partner using questions and answers to develop a shared understanding of a rabbinic text.	VIC.58c Builds upon a personal and a havruta's interpretations to coconstruct new interpretations of the text.	VIC.58d Questions havruta's interpretations in order to clarify any ambiguities and understand the assumptions and motivations generating the interpretation.
Co-Constructs Textual Meaning with Chavruta (Challenging Responses)	VIC.58e Respectfully articulates agreement or disagreement with opinions expressed by classmates and texts.	VIC.58f Asks clarifying questions of a partner's understanding of a text.	VIC.58g Responds to a partner's challenge or question by clarifying or adjusting one's own ideas.	VIC.58h Appropriately challenges a perspective (voiced by a peer or the text) based on textual evidence.
Asks for Questions from Chavruta to Sharpen a Personal Interpretation	VIC.59a Solicits questions from classmates regarding one's own perspective.	VIC.59b Creates responses to questions from classmates using the text or narrative as a source.	VIC.59c Offers a compelling alternative idea to the one proposed.	VIC.59d Reevaluates or bolsters a personal interpretation in light of one's havrutah's interpretation.